COMMON MARKET FOR EASTERN AND SOUTHERN AFRICA TRADE FACILITATION TRAINING PROGRAMME TRAINER'S MANUAL

Module 5 | Migration, trade and gender – Harassment, corruption and bribery



The opinions expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the International Organization for Migration (IOM). The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout the publication do not imply expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of IOM concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning its frontiers or boundaries.

IOM is committed to the principle that humane and orderly migration benefits migrants and society. As an intergovernmental organization, IOM acts with its partners in the international community to: assist in meeting the operational challenges of migration; advance understanding of migration issues; encourage social and economic development through migration; and uphold the human dignity and well-being of migrants.

Publisher: International Organization for Migration

17 route des Morillons

P.O. Box 17 1211 Geneva 19 Switzerland

Tel.: +41 22 717 9111 Fax: +41 22 798 6150 Email: hq@iom.int Website: www.iom.int

Cover photo: Cross-border traders push their merchandise into the Democratic Republic of the Congo

at Kasumbalesa border post. © IOM Zambia 2017

Required citation: International Organization for Migration (IOM) (2022). Module 5 - Migration, trade and

gender – Harassment, corruption and bribery. In: Common Market for Eastern and Southern

Africa Trade Facilitation Training Programme: Trainer's Manual. Geneva.

ISBN 978-92-9268-610-9 (PDF)

© IOM 2022



Some rights reserved. This work is made available under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 3.0 IGO License (CC BY-NC-ND 3.0 IGO).*

For further specifications please see the Copyright and Terms of Use.

This publication should not be used, published or redistributed for purposes primarily intended for or directed towards commercial advantage or monetary compensation, with the exception of educational purposes, e.g. to be included in textbooks.

Permissions: Requests for commercial use or further rights and licensing should be submitted to

publications@iom.int.

 $^{^*\} https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/igo/legalcode$

COMMON MARKET FOR EASTERN AND SOUTHERN AFRICA TRADE FACILITATION TRAINING PROGRAMME



Module 5 | Migration, trade and gender – Harassment, corruption and bribery











Trainer's Manual

MODULE 5

Migration, trade and gender – Harassment, corruption and bribery

CONTENTS

List of text boxes and tables	iv
Module 5. Migration, trade and gender – Harassment, corruption and bribery.	1
Pre-module warm-up and quiz	2
5.1. Background and context	3
5.1.1. Overview of the module	3
5.2. Regional and national policy coherence on migration, gender and trade	5
5.2.1. Free movement	5
5.2.2. Gender mainstreaming	6
5.3. An overview of cross-border trade and cross-border traders	7
5.3.1. Traded goods	8
5.3.2. Food security	8
5.3.3. Services provided	
5.3.4. Categories of cross-border traders	
5.3.5. Immigration perspective	9
5.4. At-border challenges faced by small-scale cross-border traders	9
5.4.1. Real and perceived cost of trading through the formal border	
5.4.2. Delays at the border	
5.4.3. Limited access to information/information asymmetry	
5.4.4. Lack of supportive infrastructure at the border	
5.4.5. Hostility, harassment and violence	12
5.5. Implemented solutions to addressing harassment, corruption	
and bribery in countries of the Common Market in Eastern and Southern Africa	12
	13
5.5.1. Facilitating the movement of persons across borders	
through effective border management	
5.5.2. Integrated/coordinated border management	
5.5.3. One-stop border posts	
5.5.5. Simplified Trade Regime	
5.5.6. COMESA Trade Information Desks	
5.5.7. Cross-border trader charter	
5.5.8. A national trade facilitation solution – Uganda Women	
Traders Trade Facilitation Framework	21
5.5.9. Non-tariff barrier reporting, monitoring and elimination mechanisms	21
5.5.10. Empowering and equipping cross-border traders	21
5.6. Barriers to addressing harassment, corruption and bribery	23
5.6.1. Lack of data	23
5.6.2. Preconceived stereotypes	24
5.6.3. Limited resources	24

5.7. Particip	ant recommendations	24					
5.8. Participant action plan							
5.9. Module	5.9. Module wrap-up						
5.10. Module conclusion							
Module 5: P	re- and post-module quiz	27					
References.		29					
L	IST OF TEXT BOXES AND TABLES						
Table 5.1. Table 5.2.	Barriers to cross border trade and recommendations to address them Template of action plan						
Tout how E 1		25					
Text box 5.1.	Informal cross-border trade						
	An informal cross-border traders survey: The Eastern African	8					
Text box 5.2.	An informal cross-border traders survey: The Eastern African Sub-regional Support Initiative for the Advancement of Women	8					
Text box 5.2.	An informal cross-border traders survey: The Eastern African Sub-regional Support Initiative for the Advancement of Women	8					
Text box 5.2. Text box 5.3.	An informal cross-border traders survey: The Eastern African Sub-regional Support Initiative for the Advancement of Women	8					
Text box 5.2. Text box 5.3.	An informal cross-border traders survey: The Eastern African Sub-regional Support Initiative for the Advancement of Women Women cross-border traders face harassment: An example from Southern Africa	811					

Module 5. Migration, trade and gender – Harassment, corruption and bribery

Module name	Migration, trade and gender – Harassment, corruption and bribery				
Module overview	This module draws attention to the intersection between migration, trade and gender by highlighting the manner in which the challenges cross-border traders face while trading expose them to harassment, corruption and bribery. The module provides evidence that these forms of abuse do indeed occur, presents solutions that have been implemented to make it easier for cross-border traders to trade within the Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA) region and challenges participants to come up with solutions to harassment, bribery and corruption that can be developed and implemented in their own countries or in the border agencies/ministries they represent.				
Module objectives	 Upon completing this module, participants will be able to: (a) Appreciate the intersection between migration, gender and trade in relation to harassment, corruption and bribery. (b) Identify the at-border challenges that make small-scale cross-border traders vulnerable to harassment, corruption and bribery. (c) Suggest solutions that can be implemented in their jurisdictions to address the situations that make traders vulnerable to harassment, corruption and bribery. 				
Target audience	Government officials responsible for border management and trade facilitation agencies in the COMESA region				
Training methods	Interactive, participatory exercises, group work, individual quizzes, experience-sharing, presentations				
Equipment and materials	LCD projector for slide presentations, flip chart and markers				
Estimated duration	295 minutes				

PRE-MODULE WARM-UP AND QUIZ

Note to the trainer: This is the fifth and final module in a five-module training package. Given the modular nature of the package, each module may be presented as a stand-alone module or as one of several modules at a multi-module workshop. The suggested warm-up activity only applies if this module is being delivered as a stand-alone module. If the module is being delivered as an additional session during a workshop in progress, this warm-up activity will not be necessary.

Suggested warm-up activity: Migration, trade and gender – Harassment, corruption and bribery

(Total discussion time in pairs: 5 minutes. Introduction: 30 minutes)

There are unlimited options on the question that participants may be asked to answer as part of the warm-up activity. The suggestions that follow are designed to get participants thinking about the challenges that cross-border traders encounter in relation to harassment, corruption and bribery, as well as about what might be done to eliminate these barriers to trade, while upholding human rights.

Invite participants to respond to the question that they can best relate to.

Questions for discussion:

- (a) What has been done at your country's borders to eliminate the incidences of harassment, corruption and bribery faced by small-scale cross-border traders?
- (b) If you could propose one solution that has not yet been implemented to eliminate the incidences of harassment, corruption and bribery faced by small-scale cross-border traders in your country, what would that solution be? Assume that money is no object.
- (c) Put yourself in the shoes of a cross-border trader. As you think about border agency officials and your upcoming trading trip to a neighbouring country, how do you think you will be treated by the border agency officials while crossing the border? What challenges do you expect to face and why?

The trainer should summarize the submissions and point out the challenges highlighted as participants presented their responses to the warm-up questions selected from the aforementioned list.

Following the warm-up activity, distribute the pre-module quiz and give participants about 10 minutes to complete it. If there is no need for a warm-up activity, distribute the pre-module quiz as the first activity of the session.

The trainer is free to create relevant warm-up activities.

5.1. Background and context

It is well documented that harassment, corruption and bribery, which are forms of abuse faced by small-scale cross-border traders, do indeed occur. A 2019 IOM case study on cross-border trade and border management in the Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA) region noted that women cross-border traders are especially vulnerable to abuses from officials when crossing borders, including bribes, sexual and physical abuse, as well as extortion and the confiscation of goods. Traders may also be requested to provide sexual favours that may increase the possibility of sexually transmitted diseases and spread of HIV (IOM, 2020).

A 2019 IOM study on the interrelationship between trade and mobility in the COMESA region found that COMESA has devoted a lot of its effort to trade facilitation and less to human mobility (IOM, 2019). COMESA needs to invest more in innovative practical mechanisms for facilitating human mobility across national borders. This calls for stronger cooperation of COMESA with IOM to strengthen the development of pragmatic solutions for human mobility in the region, lower the incidence of abuse of cross-border traders and accordingly enhance trade and development in the region.

The objective of this module is to raise awareness among policy and planning officials on the extent to which female cross-border traders encounter harassment, corruption and bribery and to motivate the development and implementation of solutions. Specific existing solutions are presented for discussion in this module.

5.1.1. Overview of the module

This module highlights the fact that small-scale cross-border traders face challenges as they conduct trade within the COMESA, and that these challenges may put them in situations where they are vulnerable to harassment, corruption and bribery. The module identifies solutions that have been implemented to reduce cross-border trader exposure to these forms of abuse, calls for integrated solutions that recognize the integration of migration, gender and trade and challenges participants to arrive at recommendations that may be implemented in their own jurisdictions.

The focus on harassment, corruption and bribery and possible solutions is what differentiates this module from Module 1: An overview of small-scale cross-border trade in COMESA. Module 1, on the other hand, provides a general overview and touches on challenges and solutions for small-scale cross-border traders from a more general point of view. In order to frame a discussion that zeroes in on harassment, corruption and bribery however, it is important for participants to briefly revisit some of the information introduced in Module 1.

Summary of key points

(a) Although migration, gender and trade are correlated, solutions for the free movement of goods and people neglect the interconnectedness of these areas and provide solutions in isolation. There is a need to provide integrated solutions spanning policy, practice and procedures that are also harmonized across borders. Failure to do so creates situations in which small-scale cross-border traders are left vulnerable to harassment, corruption and bribery.

- (b) Small-scale cross-border traders face several challenges at the border. These challenges are typically connected to perceived or real financial costs and real or perceived time delays. In an effort to avoid the costs and delays, small-scale cross-border traders may opt for "cheaper" and "faster" channels of trade (non-designated border crossings) for which there are even higher costs to pay when apprehended by the authorities. Additionally border officials may intentionally or inadvertently require payments from small-scale cross-border traders even when payments are not due. These situations all put small-scale cross-border traders in situations that leave them vulnerable to harassment, corruption and bribery.
- (c) Some solutions have been implemented to facilitate the movement of both people and goods within the COMESA region. Some of these solutions are directed towards cross-border trade in general, while others have been implemented specifically targeting small-scale cross-border traders. However, although the solutions have not necessarily targeted the elimination of harassment, corruption and bribery some of them have resulted in the lower exposure of small-scale cross-border traders to these forms of abuse, such as raising awareness of border agency and small-scale cross-border trader rights and obligations among both parties. There is an opportunity to develop and provide solutions that facilitate the movement of people and goods while also lowering the opportunities for harassment, corruption and bribery.
- (d) A number of barriers prevent the provision of the desired solutions including but not limited to a lack of appreciation of the intersection of migration, gender and trade and the challenges that result from this gap, preconceived stereotypes that prevent cooperation between border agencies and small-scale cross-border traders, as well as a sheer lack of resources available for the pursuit of integrated and harmonized solutions across policy, processes, practices, institutions and borders. The lack of data on the prevalence of harassment, corruption and bribery means that policymakers do not have the evidence they need to allocate resources towards addressing these negative conditions.
- (e) Participants are challenged to come up with solutions that can be implemented in their jurisdiction.

By the end of this module, participants will be able to:

- (a) Appreciate the intersection between migration, gender and trade in relation to harassment, corruption and bribery.
- (b) Identify the at-border challenges that make small-scale cross-border traders vulnerable to harassment, corruption and bribery.
- (c) Become aware of the solutions currently being implemented in the COMESA region to lower the exposure of small-scale cross-border traders to harassment, corruption and bribery.
- (d) Appreciate the barriers to providing solutions that will lower the exposure of small-scale cross-border traders to harassment, corruption and bribery.

(e) Identify the different ways in which border management/trade facilitation agencies can recommend/support/implement initiatives to integrate policy, practice and procedure in an effort to eliminate opportunities for harassment, corruption and bribery within the context of small-scale cross-border trade.

5.2. Regional and national policy coherence on migration, gender and trade

While regional and national policies exist on immigration, gender and trade, the policies exist within their prescribed frameworks, with limited harmonization across member States of the same Regional Economic Community (REC) and even less overlap into intersecting fields. Yet in practice, the three fields of migration, gender and trade do indeed intersect across borders and in relation to the impact of related policies, processes and practices, as well as on the activities and livelihoods of persons engaged in cross-border trade.

5.2.1. Free movement

It has been noted in previous modules that cross-border migration and trade remain a challenge due to the gap between existing regional treaties and protocols on human mobility and their actualization, as well as the absence of a harmonized approach across COMESA member States in relation to the simultaneous removal of barriers to the free movement of both goods and persons. There is an even lower recognition of the implications of the barriers to the free movement of people and goods in relation to gender. Needless to say, the resulting challenges are documented to have a disproportionately more adverse effect on women small-scale cross-border traders than on men cross-border traders (Dhliwayo, 2016).

In the Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa-East African Community-Southern African Development Community (COMESA-EAC-SADC) Tripartite Free Trade Area (ibid.),² each REC has independent free movement and trade arrangements with different provisions that make the harmonization of arrangements across the tripartite area difficult (although not impossible) to achieve. Progressive implementation of regional agreements, overlapping REC memberships and different levels of regional integration also contribute to harmonization challenges.

At the continental level, the African Union Strategy for a Better Integrated Border Governance of 2020 offers recommendations to African policymakers that enable them to align border governance with the objectives, values and principles of the African Union (African Union, 2017). However, as in the COMESA region, the strategy does not provide specific direction on the harmonization of policies, nor does the strategy demonstrate how the intersection between trade, human mobility and gender will be addressed.

The 2016 launch of the Tripartite Free Trade Area (TFTA) by the Heads of State and Government of COMESA, East African Community and SADC Member States. TFTA sought to consolidate the trade arrangements of all three Regional Economic Communities into a single trade regime and coordinate regional joint project implementation.

5.2.2. Gender mainstreaming

COMESA recognizes the importance of free movement of goods, free movement of persons, as well as gender equality and gender mainstreaming. However, the related COMESA instruments, policies, processes and practices are typically developed independently, omitting recognition of the fact that migration, gender and trade intersect and that barriers faced in each area affect participation in the other areas too.

In addition to the COMESA Visa and Free Movement Protocols, COMESA has developed a gender policy, a comprehensive framework for the support of women and youth small-scale cross-border traders, as well as guidelines for gender mainstreaming.

COMESA Gender Policy

Overall objective: To create an enabling policy environment for mainstreaming gender perspectives in all policies, structures, systems, programmes and activities of COMESA member States and the Secretariat towards gender equality, women and youth empowerment and social development.

The policy provides 22 policy objectives and measures including but not limited to women economic empowerment, trade, agriculture and child trafficking.

COMESA has also developed gender planning guidelines, checklists and indicators that guide the practical application of gender mainstreaming in COMESA policies, programmes and projects. The guidelines were developed to guide the COMESA Secretariat, COMESA institutions and COMESA member States.

Framework for the Comprehensive Support for Women and Youth Cross-Border Traders in the Region for the Period 2018–2023

Goal: To increase competitiveness of women and youth in COMESA regional economic integration processes ensuring equitable participation and benefit from regional integration programmes at all levels.

Objectives of the framework

- (a) Increase capacity and competitiveness of women and youth small-scale cross-border traders by increasing access to different resources and improve service provision.
- (b) Enhance women's access to cross-border markets through conducive policy and legal environment including adequate service provision.
- (c) Strengthen trade facilitation systems and services for women and youth small-scale cross-border traders.
- (d) Construct cross-border markets and other facilities considering the various needs and concerns of women and men traders.

- (e) Improve trade facilitation and strengthen performance management and accountability system to eliminate harassment and gender-based violence for small-scale cross-border traders.
- (f) Enhance gender research to have a good knowledge base of trade and gender in the region and gender-responsive data collection tools and analysis and monitoring and evaluation framework.

Similar to the recommendation made in Module 3 (Nexus of migration and cross-border trade) about the need for a harmonized regional approach in relation to policies, laws and procedures to facilitate cross-border migration and trade in the region, there must be a harmonized continental and regional approach to address the harassment, corruption and bribery that cross-border traders in the region face. This calls for partnering, collaboration and working across departmental, institutional and national divides.

5.3. An overview of cross-border trade and cross-border traders

An IOM think piece (Making the Case to Integrate Human Mobility into Cross-border Trade and Trade Facilitation) (IOM, 2020) states that cross-border trade is an important source of livelihoods in the COMESA region and is driven by several factors including the following: (a) resource/income differentials between countries; (b) geographical contiguity; (c) established informal commercial links; (d) existing border markets; (e) high unemployment and lack of skills; (f) high unemployment rates in the region; and (g) commodity price differences between countries.

Cross-border trade is characteristically small scale, often dominated by women (up to 80%) and youth. It is often the trader's primary source of income and in many parts of Africa, is largely informal in nature.

While definitions of informal cross-border trade vary, most of the definitions cast informal cross-border trade (the activity) and informal cross-border traders (the operators) in an unfavourable light. For instance, "informal cross-border trade" is often taken to mean illegal cross-border trade. Some of the negative tags associated with illegal trade include, but are not limited to, trade in illicit goods and trade through ungazetted border crossings by individuals who do not have the proper travel documents. Yet informal trade does not actually mean illegal trade. Informal cross-border trade may include illegal trade but that is not what it is limited to.

Text box 5.1. Informal cross-border trade

According to one definition, informal cross-border trade refers to trade in legitimately produced goods and services that escape the regulatory framework established by the government, thereby avoiding certain tax and regulatory burdens.

These goods and services may be traded by the following: (a) informal (unregistered) traders operating entirely outside the formal economy and passing through unofficial routes, without the necessary travel and entry/stay requirements; or (b) formal (registered) traders who fully or partially evade trade-related regulations and duties.

With reference to the second category above, registered traders crossing through official or gazetted border posts on occasion may: (a) **under-invoice** (i.e. report a lower quantity, weight or value of goods to pay lower import tariffs); (b) **misclassify** (i.e. falsify the description of products so that they are misclassified as products subject to lower tariffs); (c) **misreport** the country of origin; or (d) **bribe** customs officials.

Source: International Monetary Fund, n.d.a and n.d.b.

Cross-border traders may avoid the use of formal structures due to the challenges they encounter when attempting to use those structures. These challenges include but are not limited to the following: (a) difficulties in accessing trade and immigration-related documentation; (b) long waiting times at the borders; (c) corruption and sexual harassment of women traders; and (d) inadequate knowledge of border immigration and customs formalities (IOM, 2020) (see Module 1: Small-scale cross-border trade in COMESA).

5.3.1. Traded goods

Small-scale cross-border trade is characterized by the purchase of goods in one country to be resold in the trader's home country. Trade is dominated by trade in both processed and unprocessed agricultural produce. In Southern Africa, traded agricultural commodities include the following: (a) vegetables, sweet potatoes, cassava, plantains, groundnuts, cowpeas, sugar beans and green maize; (b) fruits such as bananas and mangoes; and (c) sugarcane, wheat, livestock feeds and dried fish (Blumberg et al., 2016).

5.3.2. Food security

It is widely agreed that in 2005–2006 when the COMESA region experienced critical food shortages, foodstuffs traded informally greatly lessened the impact of the food crisis. Small-scale cross-border traders continue to be recognized as main contributors to the food security of their host countries. (ibid.).

5.3.3. Services provided

In terms of services provided by small-scale cross-border traders, a study conducted in Southern Africa found that women provide private domestic work and care work, hairdressing, and prostitution. Men provide vehicle mechanical repairs, construction services as carpenters and masons, and also serve as petrol station attendants (ibid.).

5.3.4. Categories of cross-border traders

Migrant cross-border traders may be labour migrants or economic migrants who are self-employed or employed. Other categories of cross-border traders may include large-scale commercial traders, medium-size traders, formal or informal traders and small-scale cross-border traders engaged in informal trade, formal trade or both.

5.3.5. Immigration perspective

Immigration data captured at a country's borders tracks the entry and exit of people through designated border points. The data collected does not include a provision for "traders," the nature of business they conduct or the types of goods they trade in. Instead, traders fall under the general category of "business visitors".

As a result, an opportunity to collect important data on the nature of trade conducted by cross-border traders who use designated border crossings is not currently being leveraged.

5.4. At-border challenges faced by small-scale cross-border traders

The following are some of the challenges that small-scale cross-border traders face as they conduct business across borders. As mentioned previously, the challenges have a greater negative effect on women small-scale cross-border traders versus male cross-border traders for many reasons, including those presented in Module 1 of this training programme (Small-scale cross-border trade in COMESA).

5.4.1. Real and perceived cost of trading through the formal border

The real and perceived costs associated with using the designated border may push cross-border traders to use non-designated routes where they are even more vulnerable to different forms of harassment, bribery and corruption when apprehended. However, their encounters with harassment, bribery and corruption are not limited to incidences when they are apprehended while using non-designated routes. These forms of abuse also occur at designated border posts.

- (a) The cost to obtain travel document requirements and the cost of the travel document itself (USD 50–USD 100 depending on the COMESA member State) are considered high for cross-border traders. Obtaining birth certificates, passport photographs and letters of introduction may be costly and challenging. Furthermore, in some countries, travel documents are only issued in the capital city, which is costly for small-scale cross-border traders who may have to travel long distances to the capital city. A cross-border trader may therefore opt to attempt crossing a border without the necessary documentation, resulting in repercussions if apprehended.
- (b) The cost to obtain health/safety certificates may also be considered high for a small-scale cross-border trader, in terms of both money and time, such as negative COVID-19 test, sanitary and phytosanitary certificates (agricultural produce) and livestock movement permits. The cost of compliance could be considered high, especially if one has to travel from one's border home to the capital city to obtain certification. Again, these costs may motivate small-scale cross-border traders to

- look for a means of trading without going through the designated border post, with the associated repercussions if apprehended.
- (c) A variety of non-harmonized and high fees after crossing a border (such as foreign car road user charges) levied on non-nationals. For example, differences in the way road user fees are calculated from one country to the next.
- (d) Disproportionately high taxes and charges in some instances, small-scale cross-border traders pay a disproportionately higher tax rate versus the larger traders. According to a Diagnostic Trade Integration Study conducted in Zambia, at the Mwami–Mchinji border post dividing Zambia and Malawi, small traders pay on average 62 per cent more than large traders to informally move 1 tonne of a commodity across the border. The cost would triple if the traders used the formal border post (Soprano, 2014).
- (e) Tax regimes are more likely to be misunderstood by those who are less informed and do not know where to obtain information from and/or have less access to information. A poor understanding of the manner in which taxes are levied and their purpose will drive small-scale cross-border traders to identify ways to trade in which they retain a higher profit. This may not necessarily be through the designated border.

5.4.2. Delays at the border

- (a) In some countries, the laboratories with the equipment used to conduct quality tests are only found in the capital city. Travel to the city is expensive for the cross-border trader. In the United Republic of Tanzania, the Bureau of Standards is in Dar-es-Salaam. In Malawi, certificates are issued in Blantyre or Lilongwe. Testing procedures may last one week to over a month. These delays associated with compliance are costly for small-scale cross-border traders.
- (b) At some borders, small-scale cross-border traders experience customs-related and clearing agent delays, while customs officers and clearing agents process larger transactions or multiple transactions at the same time. Slow networks or shutdown networks (due to power failures) make crossing through the designated border less attractive for small-scale traders with small transactions. Delays present a heavier burden for those who have double work/care burdens such as women cross-border traders.
- (c) The non-harmonized requirements for cross-border travel from one country to the next are another challenge for small-scale cross-border traders. Differences in required travel documents (such as identification card, passport, health certificate (such as yellow fever vaccination certification and a negative COVID-19 test result) and children's birth certificates) are not always communicated or easy to find out about ahead of time. Literacy levels and access to information will affect the extent to which small-scale traders are aware of the different requirements. A parent attempting to cross the border with children may be turned back or arrested for potential child trafficking due to insufficient travel documentation.

Text box 5.2. An informal cross-border traders survey: The Eastern African Sub-regional Support Initiative for the Advancement of Women

Of the women traders, 72 per cent reported that they were stopped at least twice for checking before reaching the markets. Among these, 34 per cent were stopped thrice. Stopping for checks is not bad if they are for genuine reasons and are professionally done. The only concern is the time involved in such checks and the effect they have on the women and the perishable products.

Source: Eastern African Sub-Regional Support Initiative for the Advancement of Women (EASSI), n.d.

5.4.3. Limited access to information/information asymmetry

Both small-scale cross-border traders and border agency officials alike may not have ready access to up-to-date information on COMESA or the relevant REC trading rules and regulations. Just like cross-border traders may be unaware of trading rules and regulations, women cross-border traders stated on record that newly appointed border agency officials are not always fully aware of the relevant trading rules and regulations when appointed to border posts. In addition to a simple lack of awareness, different groups of stakeholders at the border have different sets of information in relation to regional trade. This information asymmetry also results in negative repercussions for cross-border traders who may encounter a border official who is not aware of some of the traders' rights and privileges in the context of a regional treaty.

Given the power dynamics at play between border agency officials and cross-border traders, especially when layered with gender dynamics, it is inevitable that the official's position will prevail, even when the official is in the wrong. Furthermore, unscrupulous border officials will find opportunities to take advantage of a cross-border trader who either is unaware of one's rights or may be feeling intimidated in the presence of a government official.

- (a) Due to the double work and care burden, women have limited time to participate in networks where information is shared and also have and limited time and skill to conduct research. Women are less likely to be aware of the different types of legal charges, as well as the legal amounts.
- (b) Unreceipted and unofficial fees charged by officers in uniform (police, customs, officials of the ministries of agriculture and health): This is reported as taking place under the Simplified Trade Regime (STR) where officials take advantage of cross-border traders who are unaware of the zero import tariff rate for consignments of goods that are under USD 2,000 in value and of COMESA origin.
- (c) Traders may voluntarily offer bribes to customs officials to avoid paying what the traders believe are high taxes. It has also been reported that some traders simply view offering bribes as the way things ought to be, so they offer bribes repeatedly.
- (d) When goods are confiscated without the provision of documentation confirming the act of confiscation, small-scale traders are left without the means with which to claim those confiscated goods in the future.

- (e) At some border posts, clearing agents position themselves as "one-stop-offices" and impose high charges to "handle" all clearances required. The cross-border traders who do not have access to information are more likely to be taken advantage of.
- (f) There are criminal activities by imposters masquerading as officials. Uninformed traders will be more susceptible to imposters masquerading as officials who can make the border crossing "easier" for a fee.

5.4.4. Lack of supportive infrastructure at the border

There is typically nowhere to store goods that might not get processed on a particular day due to delays at customs. This may motivate cross-border traders to either: (a) offer inducements (in various forms) for border agency officials in order to expedite the processing of their items at the border; or (b) seek to cross the border through a non-designated route. The lack of infrastructure at the border is exacerbated when considering the specific needs of female traders. The lack of ablution facilities, for example, may put additional pressure on women to expedite the processes at the border so they can quickly pass. The lack of storage facilities and lighting at the borders also forces women traders to spend more time at the border in badly lit environments. This compromises their security and puts them in even more of a vulnerable position than they already were in.

5.4.5. Hostility, harassment and violence

- (a) Sexual harassment and the accompanying risks of gender-based violence and sexually transmitted diseases have been experienced by many cross-border traders (Dhliwayo, 2016). The traders, however, are not comfortable officially reporting the incidents for fear of repercussions. Surveys show that both men and women experience sexual harassment. However, a higher frequency is reported by women.
- (b) Small-scale cross-border traders are often viewed with hostility/suspicion/mistrust by border officials (Brenton et al., 2014). Similarly, small-scale cross-border traders do not trust the border officials.

Text box 5.3. Women cross-border traders face harassment: An example from Southern Africa

One of the main challenges is that sometimes security personnel do not respect the rights of border pass holders. At the Chirundu (Zimbabwe) border control post (BCP), it is a common sight to see Zambian women with baskets on their heads and children strapped on their backs being chased away and denied exit from the border control zone by the security personnel, despite having passed through all the border control procedures. Likewise, respondents in Mchinji reported that holders of valid border passes from Malawi can be arrested and detained by immigration officials in Chipata for no apparent reason.

Source: IOM, 2019.

Categories of violence

A 2019 UKAID study on violence against women traders at border crossings conducted in the Democratic Republic of the Congo identified three categories of violence: (a) economic violence and coercion; (b) sexual violence, harassment and exploitation; and (c) physical violence and verbal harassment (Jacobson and Joekes, 2019).

Economic violence and coercion

According to the report, over 50 per cent of women cross-border traders experience economic violence and coercion by border officials and police. This includes discrimination when obtaining trade-related paperwork, border delays, unwarranted impounding of goods, bribery and corruption including coercion to pay informal fees and/or higher bribes than male traders.

Sexual violence, harassment and exploitation

According to the report, this form of violence ranges from verbal sexual harassment to rape and pressure to barter sexual favours for better treatment at the border. Evidence from Liberia indicates that 37 per cent of women cross-border traders have experienced sexual violence and harassment. In the Democratic Republic of the Congo, that figure ranges from 11 to 54 per cent.

Physical violence and verbal harassment

This includes physical assaults, robbery, insults threats, being stripped and spat on.

5.5. Implemented solutions to addressing harassment, corruption and bribery in countries of the Common Market in Eastern and Southern Africa

Experts agree that effectively linking trade facilitation and migration calls for cooperation within border management agencies and across different border management agencies. This would result in the provision of trade facilitation solutions, migration solutions and security solutions that make it easier, faster and more cost-effective for cross-border traders to trade.

The aforementioned integrated solutions all need to include solutions to the challenges that small-scale cross-border traders face in relation to violence, corruption and harassment as well. As previously noted, these issues have a disproportionately negative impact on women versus men (Brenton et al., 2014). The following are some of the solutions being implemented to make trading easier for small-scale cross-border traders. Each of the solutions, however, needs to be linked to measures that eliminate the incidences of harassment, bribery and corruption that small-scale cross-border traders face.

5.5.1. Facilitating the movement of persons across borders through effective border management

This is pillar 1 of 6 pillars identified as important in integrating human mobility and cross-border trade facilitation in the IOM think piece titled *Making the Case to Integrate Human Mobility into Cross-Border Trade and Trade Facilitation* (IOM, 2020). The pillar recommends the removal of barriers to trade, as well as the liberalization of excessive immigration control measures through visa liberalization, access to travel documentation, increased cooperation and coordination at borders and other measures including border residency arrangements.

What follows is a summary of some of the components mentioned in the think piece, as well as examples of the manner in which they are being implemented to facilitate cross-border trade. The adoption and implementation of these solutions and the widespread sharing of the rights they afford to cross-border traders across COMESA and the broader African Continental Free Trade Area could very well contribute to the lowering of the number of incidences of harassment, corruption and bribery that cross-border traders face.

Free movement of persons: Visa liberalization

Visa liberalization and the eventual removal of visa requirements is the most direct link between trade and cross-border human mobility within a regional integration context. In the COMESA context, visa liberalization and the eventual removal of visas, as outlined in the COMESA Visa Protocol, is also the first stage of the COMESA Free Movement Protocol.

The COMESA Visa Protocol includes a policy on border residence passes/cards that calls for the voluntary issuance of laissez-passer for residents of border communities to facilitate their movement. However, a harmonized definition of the following does not exist: (a) the distance past the border that is considered to be part of a border community; and (b) border residents and the privileges they are entitled to.

It however remains the prerogative of the immigration officer at the border to determine whether or not an individual can enter the territory. With or without a visa, immigration officials can also refuse entry on grounds including national security, law and order, public health or morality. It is difficult for small-scale cross-border traders to remain informed on the status of different COMESA member States in relation to visa liberalization.

Current visa solutions

- In the COMESA region, Mauritius, Rwanda and Seychelles have eliminated visa requirements for citizens from COMESA countries.
- EAC countries provide a free visitor's visa stamp with limited validity (up to six months) to citizens of EAC.
- The bilateral free mobility arrangement between Kenya and Ethiopia has been in operation for over 50 years. The two nations extend visa-free travel to each other.
- For most countries in Southern Africa, there is no visa requirement in place for nationals of countries within the region. This means that individuals who wish to enter (a neighbouring country) for trade purposes can do so for periods ranging from between 30 and 90 days without a visa.

• The Democratic Republic of the Congo and Malawi have reciprocal visa arrangements, as does Zambia. In the case of the Democratic Republic of the Congo and Zambia, visas cost USD 50 and are valid for 90 days. For an individual from the Democratic Republic of the Congo (who is not a border resident) who wishes to engage in trade in Zambia, one can obtain a renewable Zambian business visa, which is valid for 30 days and valid for up to six months upon renewal.

Travel documentation

Requiring that all travellers, including traders, must have a travel document to cross international borders, can increase the cost of trade due to the costs involved in obtaining and using travel documentation.

The COMESA Visa Protocol defines a travel document as: "a passport or any other valid travel document establishing the identity of the holder and containing his photograph, issued to him ... by the Government of the Member State of which he is a national and on which endorsement by immigration authorities may be made". Passports are only issued in the capital city and require various supporting documents, including birth certificates.

In Zimbabwe, an IOM study found that individuals often use emergency travel documents rather than a passport to cross the border at Chirundu one-stop border post (OSBP) (IOM, 2019). When asked, traders confirmed that this was due to the cost of obtaining a passport. Reliance on an emergency travel document is also likely due to the lack of a cross-border permit in Zimbabwe.

Lack of access to travel documentation may also have important ramifications for women traders with small children. During the study, it was identified that at Mchinji border control post, women small-scale cross-border traders who are breastfeeding leave their children at home in the absence of travel documentation.

Current travel document solutions

Once in force, the African Union Free Movement Protocol requires member States to cooperate in the process of identification and issuance of travel documents (Article 9). Furthermore, the introduction of an African Union passport is intended to provide a unified travel document for African nationals to travel within the continent. To date, however, the African Union passport has only been introduced to high-level diplomats. Furthermore, the cost of obtaining the African Union passport may present a financial hurdle that cross-border traders may not be able to overcome.

In the ECOWAS region, individuals can travel within the region with only their identity cards. Three of the six EAC member States (Kenya, Rwanda and Uganda) permit nationals to travel between the three East African countries using just their government-issued national identity card for identification. A passport is not required. No such arrangements exist in Southern Africa.

Border residency arrangements and provisions for cross-border traders

The creation of border residency arrangements, including the issuance of cross-border permits, is one measure States have used to facilitate the mobility of border residents and decrease the cost of cross-border travel by providing low-cost travel documentation for cross-border traders that can be used for multiple crossings over borders.

Border residency arrangements are generally put in place between two countries for whom a visa is required, or in cases where a border residency card can be recognized as a valid travel document instead of a passport or ID card.

However, there is no COMESA standard in border residency arrangements or their application. There is a lack of bilateral agreements and where national-level arrangements are in place, they do not necessarily include traders. Additionally, border residency travel documents are not always recognized by immigration authorities. Consequently, there are several challenges associated with border residency arrangements in cross-border trade. These challenges present opportunities for cross-border traders to face abuse or harassment at the hands of border agency officials.

Border residence/cross-border trader provision examples from Southern and Eastern Africa

A COMESA/ILO study found that Zambia has an arrangement with all its neighbouring countries in which Zambian nationals who reside in border communities are able to travel to the neighbouring country by using a simple border pass as a travel document (IOM, 2020). The documents are not harmonized, are not electronic and vary in format, cost and validity terms. Information from the documents is not entered into a border management information system and therefore, information on the document holders is not captured.

As part of the COMESA-managed Eleventh European Development Fund project, IOM is supporting the development of an e-jeton system to be piloted at Kasumbalesa BCP to capture data on exit/entry movements of small-scale cross-border traders at the Kasumbalesa BCP. The goal is to formulate a system for the issuance of a travel e-document that is robust and not open to abuse. It includes the use of biometrics and will also facilitate movement of local traders through Kasumbalesa BCP.

In EAC, there is a 10-kilometre radius surrounding border posts, in which travellers from the neighbouring EAC member State are not required to have travel documents. Beyond the 10-kilometre radius however, proof of having crossed through the designated border and proper identification are required.

Management information systems

The facilitation of the movement of goods and people can be hampered by a lack of infrastructure and immigration information technology systems, including insufficient information and data-sharing between authorities operating at the border, which can slow down cross-border checks.

While strides are being made in the introduction of customs systems, with most countries having an automated customs data system such as Automated System for Customs Data (ASYCUDA) or ASYCUDA World (which excludes small-scale cross-border traders) in place, no global border management information systems exist.

A 2016 informal cross-border trade gender assessment report published by Banyan Global recommended the incorporation of advances in information and communications technology into informal cross-border trade border operations (Blumberg et al., 2016). The report stated that in addition to improving efficiency, automation reduces corruption tendencies, as well as opportunities for harassment.

Trade information portals

National trade information portals have been established in EAC countries, as well as in Malawi and Zimbabwe. Formally registered traders are able to access all relevant trade rules, regulations, procedures, fee schedules and forms from all border management agencies through a single user-friendly website. However, the online information portals only address formal trading procedures and do not include the simplified trade procedures extended to traders operating under STR for transactions that are equal to or less than USD 2,000.

5.5.2. Integrated/coordinated border management

An integrated/coordinated border management approach provides a means of achieving safe and effective cross-border collaboration and cooperation. Such cooperation would also make it faster, easier and thus more attractive for cross-border traders to obtain clearance for themselves and their products through the borders. These approaches both require and facilitate collaboration among the different border agencies including law enforcement, immigration, customs, police and other specialized law enforcement agencies (IOM, 2020).

Examples of collaboration include but are not limited to the following:

- Cross-border and inter-agency cooperation on security measures, such as surveillance, joint controls, operations and patrols.
- Engagement with border communities through control and policing.
- Border management operations grounded in intelligence risk profiling and risk analysis to use resources for targeted actions.
- Partner States:
 - Ensuring the integrity and security of travel documentation used by traders, preventing such documents being forged, counterfeited or fraudulently obtained, and ensuring that the document belongs to the person presenting it.
 - Examining document issuance processes to address the issue of fraudulently obtained genuine travel documents as a means of combating transborder crime.

Regional and national policy and operational coherence is central for the above-mentioned integrated/coordinated border management approaches to work. Furthermore, these streamlined border management systems and practices will allow for more secure border environments, as well as the tracking and capture of accurate data on the cross-border movements of cross-border traders, their activities and the value of the goods and services they trade in must be tracked in order to inform effective policy and decision-making on behalf of cross-border traders. Such evidence-based policy formulation would contribute to the addressing and eventual elimination of issues of corruption, harassment and bribery that cross-border traders currently face.

5.5.3. One-stop border posts

The OSBP concept promotes a coordinated and integrated border management approach to facilitating trade, the movement of people and improvement of security. The concept eliminates the need for travellers and goods to stop twice to undertake border crossing formalities, calling for the application of joint controls to minimize routine activities and duplications. It therefore reduces the journey time for transporters and travellers and shortens the clearance time at border crossing points.

OSBPs further reduce the touch points between cross-border traders and border agencies for the cross-border traders who use them and thus lower the opportunity for cross-border traders to experience corruption, harassment and bribery.

Operational one-stop border posts

By 2020, EAC had fully operationalized and trained personnel at several OSBPs. This has reduced the time taken by travellers (including small-scale cross-border traders) and trucks at the borders from several days to an average of 1.5 minutes and 30 minutes respectively (EAC, 2018). OSBPs provide an example of the efficiencies that result from shared cross-border infrastructure. Efficient border crossings will appeal to small-scale cross-border traders who are interested in saving time.

Within the COMESA countries, there are a total of 12 functioning OSBPs at the following borders:

- (a) Busia (Kenya-Uganda)
- (b) Chirundu (Zambia–Zimbabwe)
- (c) Elegu–Nimule (Uganda–South Sudan)
- (d) Malaba (Kenya-Uganda)
- (e) Moyale (Ethiopia–Kenya)
- (f) Mutukula (United Republic of Tanzania–Uganda)
- (g) Tunduma-Nakonde (United Republic of Tanzania-Zambia)
- (h) Taveta-Holili (Kenya-United Republic of Tanzania)

Positive results reported

- Following the opening of the Chirundu OSBP between Zambia and Zimbabwe, border crossing time went down from two to three days, to two hours. The number of trucks cleared each day increased from 260 to 600 (The Herald, 2016).
- Similar successes are reported at the Busia OSBP between Kenya and Uganda. The time it took for a truck to cross the border from Kenya to Uganda has gone down from over 14 hours in 2011 to just under 3 hours (TradeMark East Africa, 2018).
- Interviews with small-scale cross-border traders indicate that they appreciate the
 increased efficiencies in clearing border formalities gained from only having to stop
 in the destination country and not both the country of origin and the destination
 country, as was the case before the introduction of OSBPs.
- Of the women in an EAC study on informal cross-border trader, 48.5 per cent spent less than an hour at customs clearing their products (EASSI, n.d.).

5.5.4. Cross-border/joint border committees

Joint border committees (JBCs) are working groups made up of government agencies and private sector stakeholders involved in cross-border trade. They promote coordination between government agencies and businesses to enhance efficiency at borders. JBCs may be formed on a national or cross-border basis. JBCs formed at borders are encouraged to include a representative/representatives from the cross-border trader community. Increased interaction between the different stakeholders contributes to a reversal of stereotypes that influence the nature of the relationship between stakeholders, which can be described as "hostile" especially between border agency officials and small-scale cross-border traders (Brenton et al., 2014).

Text box 5.4. Examples of cross-border cooperation from Malawi, Zambia and Zimbabwe

IOM provides support through the following:

- Address protection concerns, including assistance and referral to relevant authorities, the development of legislation and regulations, operational guidance, as well as capacity-building for border officials on issues such as protection of victims of trafficking and unaccompanied migrant children.
- Establish cross-border migration management stakeholder forums for increased bilateral coordination.

Malawi, Zambia and Zimbabwe have implemented the following:

- A national referral mechanism and standard operating procedures for the identification, referral, protection and safe return of victims of trafficking.
- Sustainable border forums at various border control posts including Chirundu OSBP.
 The Chirundu Cross-Border Migration Management Stakeholder Forum has provided
 opportunities to discuss protection of unaccompanied migrant children, stranded
 children and vulnerable migrants.

In 2017, Malawi put into place the first Cross-Border Migration Forum with Mozambique.

Source: IOM, 2019.

5.5.5. Simplified Trade Regime

STR is an arrangement implemented by member States of COMESA to formalize and improve the performance of the small-scale cross-border traders and enable them to benefit from the regional preferential treatment when importing or exporting goods within the region (COMESA, n.d.).

The STR of COMESA targets small-scale traders importing and/or exporting goods on the Common List of Eligible Products between two neighbouring countries, worth USD 2,000 or less in transaction value. STR provides simplified customs clearance procedures that make it easier for small-scale traders to cross the border using a simplified certificate of origin and a simplified customs document. Participating member States include Burundi, Kenya, Malawi, Rwanda, Uganda, Zambia and Zimbabwe (ibid.).

5.5.6. COMESA Trade Information Desks

COMESA has established Trade Information Desks (TIDs) at some COMESA borders. Uniformed Trade Desk Information Officers (TIDOs) provide information and documents to traders. In some countries such as Uganda and Kenya, TIDOs are authorized to issue Simplified Certificates of Origin. However, COMESA does not necessarily provide resources for the remuneration of TIDOs resulting in empty TIDs at some border points.

5.5.7. Cross-border trader charter

In 2014 in a three-way partnership, the Ministry of Commerce, Trade and Industry of Zambia, the Ministry of Industry and Trade of Malawi and the World Bank developed the Charter for Cross-border Traders. Piloted at the Mwami–Mchinji border post in Zambia–Malawi, the Charter aimed to improve the treatment of traders at the border, introduce technology-based mechanisms for the report of abuse and increase the efficiency of trade flows. Regular training and sensitization of both border agencies and traders was to be conducted to ensure that all stakeholders were well aware of the stipulations in the Charter (Brenton et al., 2014).

Unlike an internal agency or institutional code of conduct, this Charter documents the rights and obligations of both traders and officials using a mirror approach. Each trader's right corresponds to an official's obligation and vice versa. It also includes a number of provisions to specifically address gender-related issues. For example, in addition to providing a toll-free number for information requests and the reporting of abuse (call or text message), there is a specific toll-free number dedicated to the reporting of gender-based issues. Trader associations and civil society organizations have the opportunity to follow-up on reported cases via a technology-based platform (Soprano, 2014).

Examples of the mirror approach employed throughout the charter include the following (ibid.):

 If a physical check must be conducted of a female trader, the female trader has the right to require that a female official conduct the search in a private and accountable environment. Traders must treat officials respectfully and avoid offering inducements for preferential treatment such as bribes or other favours.

In 2017, the Charter was launched at the Uganda–Rwanda border of Mirama–Kagitumba. The Charter was to be piloted at Mirama–Kagitumba, as well as at the United Republic of Tanzania–Uganda border of Mutukula, prior to implementation across the rest of EAC (EASSI, 2017).

5.5.8. A national trade facilitation solution – Uganda Women Traders Trade Facilitation Framework

It will be important to evaluate the extent to which the Charter for Cross-border Traders has been implemented in COMESA countries, as well as the level of success in relation to the intended objectives and outcomes.

In 2018, after extensive consultation with women trader groups, the Uganda Revenue Authority (URA) launched its Women in Trade Facilitation Framework. The Framework allows URA to adapt customs services to the needs of women traders. To support implementation, URA has appointed gender champions at Uganda's OSBPs. Furthermore, each OSBP is required to provide office space to house the local women cross-border traders' association. Under the Framework, URA has conducted training on customs policies and procedures for members of women cross-border traders associations; and at some OSBP locations such as Busia, Uganda, URA provides storage of goods at no cost to the women cross-border traders (World Customs Organization, 2019).

Anecdotal information shows that these arrangements, including the deliberate effort to engage with women cross-border traders through their associations, have resulted in a warming of the relationship between women cross-border traders and customs officials at selected Uganda borders. The women cross-border traders who belong to the women cross-border traders' association in their community are less likely to trade through undesignated border crossings.

5.5.9. Non-tariff barrier reporting, monitoring and elimination mechanisms

The COMESA member States agreed to create National Monitoring Committees to track and resolve the non-tariff barriers (NTBs) reported in their respective countries; however, many of these committees are yet to be operationalized. In the meantime, members of the business community who wish to report NTBs they encounter may use the following webbased NTB reporting mechanism: www.tradebarriers.org/register_complaint.

5.5.10. Empowering and equipping cross-border traders

With cross-border trade being an important source of livelihood in the COMESA region, yet largely informal in nature, the provision of traders with the skills, knowledge and information to increase their income-earning capacity and encourage them to trade formally could yield several positive results in terms of their contribution to the formal economy while also indirectly reducing the NTBs they face.

Cross-border traders' associations (and similar organizations such as women in business associations) exist in all COMESA countries. These are non-governmental bodies that represent and defend the interests of small-scale cross-border traders by informing and advising traders about their rights and obligations. However, these associations tend to be weak, poorly equipped, have low membership, are not formally registered and face human and financial resource constraints.

Training of women cross-border traders in the Democratic Republic of the Congo

The World Bank's Great Lakes project aimed to provide a safe environment for small-scale cross-border traders in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, as well as the neighbouring Great Lakes countries. One of the project components included the training of 300 women traders on the following:

- (a) Protecting their rights;
- (b) Holding customs officials accountable;
- (c) Developing and organizing small trader cooperatives;
- (d) Negotiation techniques;
- (e) Tax classification;
- (f) Small business management;

The project also provided training for border officials on handling cross-border traders and supported dialogues between traders and State agents on the challenges cross-border traders face and possible solutions.

Results

- As a result of the training, 60 per cent fewer cases of harassment were reported at the Democratic Republic of the Congo borders with Rwanda and Uganda (International Alert, 2020).
- The training leads to an increase in the non-payment of bribes by 5 percentage points on average across the sample and by 27.5 percentage points on average among the compliers. The training also lowers the overall incidence of gender-based violence by 5.4 percentage points on average across the sample and by 30.5 percentage points on average among the compliers. However, there is no improvement in self-reported knowledge following the training. This is interpreted as occurring because the duty-free regulations were not fully clarified by the Government of the Democratic Republic of the Congo at the time of the workshops (Croke et al., 2020).

The example that follows also demonstrates the impact of equipping cross-border traders with skills, knowledge and information. The traders now trade formally through their cooperatives and have expanded their activities into other productive sectors.

Text box 5.5. Example of cross-border traders trainings

Pro-Femmes Twese Hamwe, Rwanda is an umbrella association of 53 women's economic empowerment associations representing over 45,000 individual members. Between 2012 and 2018, with support from TradeMark East Africa, Pro-Femmes organized over 3,000 women cross-border traders into 63 cooperatives with over 3,000 members. The women cross-border traders received training on regional trade rules and regulations, access to markets and finance. Today, those cooperatives are thriving, with the cooperatives expanding into other productive sectors (such as agroprocessing and tailoring) and providing affordable loans to members.

Source: https://profemmes.org/.

Organizations are beginning to recognize the value in providing "integrated" programmes to cross-border traders' associations. An integrated programme addresses a number of interconnected issues, all of which result in challenges for cross-border traders. Helping cross-border traders get organized to trade formally, provide information on trading rules and regulations, inform traders of their rights and obligations (and those of border agency officials), as well as providing a means for women cross-border traders to access credit will equip cross-border traders to trade confidently, efficiently and profitably from an informed knowledge base. These changes will reduce their vulnerability to harassment, corruption or bribery.

5.6. Barriers to addressing harassment, corruption and bribery

A number of barriers stand in the way of addressing harassment, corruption and bribery. As demonstrated in Module 3, there is a lack of recognition of the link between migration and trade. It is therefore no surprise that there is also a lack of recognition of the link between migration, trade and gender. This in itself makes it difficult to advocate for the inclusion of gender issues or the mainstreaming of gender in matters pertaining to trade. It is important for this intersection to be recognized if progress is to be made in addressing the challenges linked to harassment, corruption and bribery, all of which are experienced by both men and women, but documented to have a more adverse effect on women (Dhliwayo, 2016).

5.6.1. Lack of data

The low incidence of reporting harassment, corruption and bribery and the position of some border agencies which hold that there is no harassment, corruption or bribery at their border posts all make it difficult to put a number to the challenges associated with these forms of abuse. In many situations, there are no means provided for the reporting of complaints. Where reporting mechanisms exist, cross-border traders may be afraid of being victimized for having reported against the authorities. Data may be obtained from conducting studies specific to obtaining this information. However, this kind of research study does not always attract financial resources. Indeed, while studies show that harassment, corruption and bribery are widely recognized as a barrier to trade, they are not recognized as such in any trade barrier tracking mechanisms. A lack of evidence translates into no resource allocation by government.

5.6.2. Preconceived stereotypes

The nature of the relationship between cross-border traders and border agency officials varies from one border to the next. While at some border posts the relationship is warming, generally speaking, the relationship is adversarial. Each side views the other with suspicion and even hostility (Brenton et al., 2014). In this type of environment, it is difficult for respectful and professional discourses to be held.

The improvement of the attitude of border agency officials towards cross-border traders and the reverse will greatly contribute to the development of harmonious relationships on both sides that in turn will result in better treatment from each side towards the other. This should ultimately lead to a reduction in the reported incidences of abuse, as has been reported anecdotally in Busia, Uganda. On a number of occasions, the Busia Women Cross Border Traders Cooperative Society Ltd., Uganda has successfully intervened on behalf of women cross-border traders who have been detained for allegedly violating EAC trading rules and regulations.

5.6.3. Limited resources

Like other countries across Africa, COMESA countries face a lack of resources (human and financial). This makes it difficult for them to construct or obtain the necessary infrastructure and technology that would limit human touchpoints at the border and thus lower the opportunities for harassment, corruption and bribery.

Limited resources make it difficult for COMESA member States to effectively act on mandatory and voluntary regional obligations and/or to harmonize policies, practices and procedures across the region.

In situations with limited resources and several other national needs, training to raise the awareness of cross-border traders as well as border agency officials on each other's rights and obligations is not viewed as a priority. However, when training resources are made available and trainings are conducted for both border agency officials and cross-border traders on their rights and obligations, as well as the trading rules and regulations, improved relationships are reported, as well as successes in the reduction of reported cases of abuse.

5.7. Participant recommendations

In this section, participants will identify three to four barriers that will make it difficult for their particular agency to link migration, trade and gender in policy, procedure and practice with a view to addressing the corruption, harassment and bribery challenges that cross-border traders face. The participants will develop recommendations to address the identified barriers.

Table 5.1. Barriers to cross border trade and recommendations to address them

	Barrier identified	Recommendation
1.		
2.		
3.		
4.		

5.8. Participant action plan

In this section, training participants are given time to create action plans for providing solutions to the challenges cross-border traders face in relation to corruption, harassment and bribery. The action plans identify the barriers to be overcome, recommendations, activities, timelines, estimated budget and the names of the officers or departments responsible for implementing each activity. Participants will provide their information in the table that follows.

Table 5.2. Template of action plan

	Barrier	Recommendation	Activity	Timing	Responsible	Budget
1.						
2.						
3.						
4.						

In addition to developing an action plan, participants will also identify the hurdles they might face in attempting to implement the aforementioned recommendations and provide suggested solutions.



What challenges will you face as you implement the above recommendations?

How will you address those challenges?

5.9. Module wrap-up

The trainer will conclude the session through the following:

- (a) Reviewing a list of the topics covered within the module.
- (b) Highlighting the information participants provided in their action plan, specifically the following:
 - (i) Key barriers identified;
 - (ii) The solutions participants suggested their agencies could provide.
- (c) Two or three challenges participants will face in implementing the recommendations and proposed solutions.
- (d) Distributing the post-module quiz.
- (e) Reviewing the module objectives and confirming with participants that the objectives have been met.

5.10. Module conclusion

Upon completion of this module, participants are able to:

- (a) Appreciate the intersection between migration, gender and trade in relation to harassment, corruption and bribery.
- (b) Identify the at-border challenges that make small-scale cross-border traders vulnerable to harassment, corruption and bribery.
- (c) Suggest solutions that can be implemented in their jurisdiction to address the situations that make traders vulnerable to harassment, corruption and bribery.

MODULÉ 5: PRE- AND POST-MODULE QUIZ

- 1. The following barriers prevent the provision of integrated solutions that address challenges at the intersection of migration, gender and trade.
 - A. Preconceived stereotypes that prevent cooperation between border agencies and small-scale cross-border traders.
 - B. Lack of resources for the pursuit of integrated and harmonized solutions.
 - C. Lack of data to support the position that the three areas do indeed intersect and do indeed call for harmonized solutions.
 - D. All the above.
- 2. The 2014 Charter for Cross-Border Trader:
 - A. Provides tips on how border agencies may apprehend cross-border traders engaged in illegal practices.
 - B. Documents the rights and obligations of both traders and officials.
 - C. Focuses on the manner in which cross-border traders must interact with each other.
 - D. Provides instructions on chartering transportation for cross-border traders.
- 3. Although the COMESA Visa Protocol includes a policy on border residence passes/cards, it falls short of promoting free movement for border residents because:
 - A. The distance past the border that is considered to be part of a border community is not harmonized across COMESA.
 - B. A harmonized definition of border residents and the privileges they are entitled to does not exist.
 - C. It remains the prerogative of the immigration officer to determine whether or not an individual can enter the territory regardless of whether the individual has met the required conditions for entry or not.
 - D. All the above.
- 4. COMESA established TIDs staffed by uniformed TIDOs at some borders to:
 - A. Provide an alternative border crossing point for traders.
 - B. Provide information and documents to traders
 - C. Negotiate import tariffs with COMESA trading partners.
 - D. Supervise revenue collection at border posts.
- Although migration, gender and trade are correlated, solutions for the free movement of goods and people neglect the inter-connectedness of these areas and provide solutions in isolation.

True False

6. Both small-scale cross-border traders and border agency officials may not have ready access to current information on trading rules and regulations.

True False

7. OSBPs reduce touchpoints between cross-border traders and border agencies and lower opportunities for traders to experience corruption, harassment and bribery.

True False

- 8. It is impossible to develop and provide solutions that facilitate the movement of people and goods while also lowering the opportunities for harassment, corruption and bribery.

 True False
- 9. Helping cross-border traders get organized to trade formally, provide information on trading rules and regulations, inform traders of their rights and obligations (and those of border agency officials), as well as provide a means for women cross-border traders to access credit will encourage more of them to pursue illegal trade.

True False

10. Border agencies must rely entirely on cross-border traders' associations to prevent cross-border traders from experiencing bribery and corruption.

True False

Quiz answers

1 – D; 2 – B; 3 – D; 4 – B; 5 – True; 6 – True; 7 – True; 8 – False; 9 – False; 10 – False



African Union

Draft African Union Border Governance Strategy. Addis Ababa. Available at www. peaceau.org/uploads/2018-06-14-aubgs-e.pdf.

Blumberg, R.L., J. Malaba and L. Meyers

Women Cross-Border Traders in Southern Africa: Contributions, Constraints, and Opportunities in Malawi and Botswana. USAID Southern Africa Trade Hub. Available at https://banyanglobal.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/ICBT-Gender-Assessment-Report_Final_4-30-2016_DEC.pdf.

Brenton, P., N. Dihel, M. Hoppe and C. Soprano

Improving behaviour at borders to promote trade formalization: The charter for cross-border traders. *Africa Trade Policy Notes* no. 41. World Bank, Washington, D.C. Available at http://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/894601468346146304/pdf/894730BRIOChar0Box0385291B00PUBLIC0.pdf.

Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA)

n.d. Programme activities: Trade liberalization. Available at www.comesa.int/programme-activities-trade-liberalization/.

Croke, K. M. E. Garcia Mora, M. Goldstein, E. Mensah, M. O'Sullivan

Up before dawn: Experimental evidence from a cross-border trader training at the Democratic Republic of Congo—Rwanda Border. Policy Research Working Paper no. 9123. World Bank, Washington, D.C. Available at https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/33258.

Dhliwayo, S.

2016 Export experience and key success factors in cross- border trade: Evidence from Southern Africa. *Acta Commercii (Independent Research Journal in the Management Sciences)*, 17(1):a383.

East African Community

2018 EAC operationalizes 13 one-stop border posts. 2 November. Available at https://eac.int/press-releases/142-customs/1276-eac-operationalizes-13-one-stop-border-posts.

Eastern African Sub-Regional Support Initiative for the Advancement of Women (EASSI)

2017 Charter for cross-border traders launched. 22 June. Available at https://eassi.org/charter-for-cross-border-traders-launched/.

n.d. Empowering women informal cross border traders in the East African Common Market. Available at https://eassi.org/project/women-informal-cross-border-traders-eac-market/.

International Alert

2020 Cross-border trade during COVID 19: Julliene's story. June. Available at https://international-alert.org/stories/cross-border-trade-during-covid-19-jullienes-story/?.

^{*} All hyperlinks were working at the time of writing this report.

International Monetary Fund

n.d.a Rwanda: Measuring informal cross border trade between Rwanda and her neighboring countries. Available at https://imf.org/en/Data/Statistics/informal-economy-data/Reports/rwanda-measuring-informal-cross-border-trade.

n.d.b COMESA cross border initiative. Available at https://imf.org/en/Data/Statistics/informal-economy-data/Reports/COMESA-Cross-Border-Initiative.

International Organization for Migration (IOM)

2019 Study on the Interrelationship between Trade and Mobility in the COMESA Region. International Organization for Migration (IOM). Geneva. Available at https://publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/Regional-Study-Mig-Trade_0.pdf.

2020 Making the Case to Integrate Human Mobility into Cross-border Trade and Trade Facilitation

— Cross-border Trade and Border Management in Select Countries and Borders in the

COMESA Region: A Case Study. Geneva. Available at https://publications.iom.int/books/

making-case-integrate-human-mobility-cross-border-trade-and-trade-facilitation.

Jacobson, J. and S. Joekes

Violence against women traders at border crossings. Work and Opportunities for Women Helpdesk Query 31. Available at https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/876256/Query-31-VAW-Traders.pdf.

Soprano, C.

A step toward formalization: The charter for cross-border traders. World Bank Blogs, 19 August. Available at https://blogs.worldbank.org/trade/step-toward-formalization-charter-cross-border-traders.

The Herald

Barriers at border posts hinder trade in Africa. 18 November. Available at https://herald.co.zw/barriers-at-border-posts-hinder-trade-in-africa/.

TradeMark East Africa

One-Stop Border Posts: Enhancing Trade and Regional Integration in East Africa. n.p. Available at www.trademarkea.com/onestopborderposts/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/TMEA-OSBP-Coffee-Table-Book-1.pdf.

World Customs Organization

2019 WCO jointly organises a session on gender on the occasion of the 2019 Global Review of Aid for Trade. 9 July. Available at www.wcoomd.org/en/media/newsroom/2019/july/wco-jointly-organises-a-session-on-gender-on-the-occasion-of-the-2019.aspx.

