THE TRADITION OF TOIL

The interplay of social norms and stigma in relation to human trafficking in Indonesia
Case Study: West Sumba and South-west Sumba

Commissioned by IOM UK

IOM UN MIGRATION

embode

UKaid
from the British people

This research has been funded by UK aid from the United Kingdom Government's Modern Slavery Innovation Fund. The views expressed do not necessarily reflect the United Kingdom Government's official policies.

Thank you to Dr Patrick Burland, Sarah Di Giglio and Joseph Slowey from IOM United Kingdom and Asep Zulhijar and Among Resi from IOM Indonesia for their support during the research and inputs into this report.

Publisher: International Organization for Migration
17 route des Morillons
P.O. Box 17
1211 Geneva 19
Switzerland
Tel.: +41 22 717 9111
Fax: +41 22 798 6150
Email: hq@iom.int
Website: www.iom.int

Cover photo: Focus group dicussion with female returnee migrants in Sumba. © Embode 2019

ISBN 978-92-9068-944-7 (Print)
ISBN 978-92-9068-930-0 (PDF)

International Organization for Migration (IOM), 2021. *The Tradition of Toil: The interplay of social norms and stigma in relation to human trafficking in Indonesia.* Geneva.

Authors: Liva Sreedharan and Aarti Kapoor. Editors: Verity Kowal and Vanessa Hongsathavij. Literature review and field research conducted by Liva Sreedharan and Tita Naovalitha. Senior advisory provided by David Feingold, PhD.
www.embode.co
info@embode.co

Graphic design by Suzaku Productions. www.suzakuproductions.com

PUB2021/041/R

THE TRADITION OF TOIL

The interplay of social norms and stigma in relation to human trafficking in Indonesia
Case Study: West Sumba and South-west Sumba

Commissioned by IOM UK

IOM UN MIGRATION

embode

UKaid from the British people

CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES

GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ATTF	Anti Trafficking Task Force
BP2MI/ BNP2TKI	Agency for the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers (Badan Pelindungan Pekerja Migran Indonesia). Formally known as National Agency for Placement and Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers (Badan Nasional Penempatan dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia)
CSO	Civil Society Organization
FBO	Faith-Based Organization
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
ILO	International Labour Organization
IOM	International Organization for Migration
JRuK	Volunteer Network for Humanity (Jaringan Relawan untuk Kemanusiaan)
KII	Key Informant Interview
LPSK	Agency for the Protection of Victims and Witnesses (Lembaga Perlindungan Saksi dan Korban)
Kemenko PMK	Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture, Indonesia (Kementerian Koordinator Bidang Pembangunan Manusia dan Kebudayaan, Republik Indonesia)
Kemensos	Ministry of Social Affairs, Indonesia (Kementerian Sosal)
Kemnaker	Ministry of Manpower, Indonesia (Kementerian Ketenagakerjaan)
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MoWECP	Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, Indonesia (Kementerian Pemberdayaan Perempuan dan Perlindungan Anak)
NATTF	National Anti-Trafficking Task Force, Indonesia (Gugus Tugas Pencegahan dan Penanganan Tindak Pidana Perdagangan Orang)
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NTT	East Nusa Tenggara (Nusa Tenggara Timur)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report provides an overview of how social norms and stigma can be drivers of vulnerability to trafficking and barriers to effective reintegration of survivors in West Sumba and South-west Sumba, Indonesia. It explores the ways in which social pressures and expectations that are put on people to migrate, in turn, heighten the risk of trafficking and exploitation of individuals, particularly women. Of note, the data gathering phase only identified cases relating to female returnees. This involved seven direct interviews with female returnees as well as interviews with family members of other female migrants, as well as community members. Therefore, the research builds understanding on how the roles played by family members, communities and service providers, due to historical norms and influences, shape agency and access of returnee migrant women to service providers in Indonesia. This Executive Summary provides an overview of the key findings from the research.

The narrative of migration as "positive" and "aspirational" remains unchallenged

Low economic prospects continue to push labour migration in the region of Sumba, East Nusa Tenggara, where the regencies of West Sumba and South-west Sumba have high numbers of registered Indonesian workers for overseas employment. Most migrants from Sumba are women and migrate into sectors of work which reflect stereotypical gendered division of labour. More specifically, stakeholders identified the low literacy rate as one of the key push factors for out-migration, as a less educated workforce are more likely to be targets recruited by labour agencies.

In this context, the recruitment of women migrants is promoted as poverty alleviation strategy. Sumba's labour migration industry is both well-established and lucrative, and is populated by recruitment agents offering services for aspiring Sumbanese looking for employment and promising salaries abroad. Recruitment agents specifically target young prospective migrants for labour migration to meet the demand for women workers in destination countries. Young Sumbanese are bought-in by the prospects of experiencing a more modern lifestyle abroad, as well as the opportunity to improve the economic standing of themselves and their families.

Widely prevalent and embedded into the recruitment of women migrants is the narrative that migration is both positive and aspirational. This narrative is rarely challenged or verified by prospective migrants, and is widespread among family members of returnee migrants and community, creating social expectations around the experience of migration. This narrative is sold by many recruitment agents and exhibits the level of social expectations placed on those who migrate. However, as it is based on incomplete or potentially biased oral testimony and the narrative lacks credible and formal sources of information. This absence of diverse narratives is likely to amplify the sense of personal failure by the migrant who has an unsuccessful migration experience relative to these oral testimonies. The key finding from this research indicated that the narrative of migration is therefore likely to deepen the social expectations and risks of migration among prospective migrants and their communities.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Media and government agencies should seek opportunities to tell more "real" stories of migration through sponsoring TV channels, radio and other outlets to produce films, serials and songs on the subject.

2. Local government and community leaders should seek to open conversations and discussions about the more risky and negative sides of migration to enable more balanced conversations and sharing about what migrants' experience.

Gender-based social norms are critical to understanding migration choices and outcomes

The value of women's work is a key social norm that impacts women's migration choices. In Sumba, although women are socially expected to contribute financially to their households, their work is not valued equal to men and does not give them equivalent standing in the household. For example, no matter their financial contributions to the family, they are rarely considered breadwinners or heads of households and have little control over how the family's economic resources are allocated or spent. This secondary standing of women in the family has a significant influence on why and how they migrate.

This research also found that gender-based social norms have a significant influence on migration drivers, choices and outcomes for people in Sumba. The gendered social hierarchy is influenced by traditional norms (locally known as "adat"), which provide clear directions about the roles of men and women. These include norms that undervalue women's work and positions women and girls in secondary standing within the family, which creates barriers in their access to education, resources, and opportunities. This research further indicated the strong social expectations placed upon women with regard to family debt and marriage. There is a cultural expectation placed upon families to host important cultural ceremonies, and women are often left responsible for the financial burden these ceramonies have imposed on their husbands and families, and feel responsible to help them pay it off. These cultural norms, in turn, push more women to migrate abroad, with the expectation that they should migrate to sustain family incomes despite the personal risks to their safety and well-being.

Systemic disempowerment of women

Due to the patriarchal structures that sustain unequal patterns of decision-making, various actors - including husbands, other family members and State institutions - exert control over a woman's migration choices. These choices result in several migration risks when women must navigate migration channels to obtain permission to travel abroad, as well as when they return to their communities and families and must face the consequences arising from their choice to migrate.

Consequently, in order to migrate abroad for work, women in Sumba must navigate formal and informal paternalistic power structures and bureaucratic processes that have the effect of removing or shrinking women migrants' agency. This dynamic is evident in women migrants' reliance on labour recruiters and brokers, who are deemed as "heroes" and "warriors" by the community for assisting with poverty alleviation by providing job opportunities for villagers. This esteem for brokers – licensed and unlicensed – is attributed to their ability to navigate intimidating bureaucratic procedures for migration within a short time. In this position of influence, the recruitment agents and brokers in Sumba play a paternalistic, but often disempowering role for potential migrants who are advised to be submissive vis-à-vis those who employ them in the country of destination. Such advice strengthens the cultural conditioning of female migrants to put the needs of others first and not to question the voice of male authority, which, in turn, further normalizes exploitative and abusive practices perpetrated by employers in destination countries.

In addition to the recruitment agents and brokers, other gatekeepers and migration practices reveal the paternalism that pervades the start of the migration cycle; this is best exemplified by the requirement for prospective migrants to obtain written permission to travel from village heads and family members. Although the requirement applies equally to men and women, the impact of this requirement on the pattern of feminized labour migration from Sumba has gender-differentiated implications by forming a barrier to safe migration. The requirement shifts the decision-making power of a woman migrant on her migration choices to patriarchal figures at the very beginning of the migration cycle. Navigating such administrative paperwork, as well as patriarchal structures can often push women into using irregular migration channels.

This disempowering effect on women migrant workers through social norms and unequal structures has yet to be effectively targeted at the government and community level. At the time of the research, central government initiatives to redress the imbalanced impact of gendered norms have yet to reach Sumba. The research also did not identify local efforts, such as the programmes through the local Church, that have been implemented to address these social norms.

RECOMMENDATIONS

3. Local government agencies should collaborate and support faith-based organizations to conduct awareness-raising at the community level, focusing on providing basic information on abuse, exploitation and violence in its myriad of forms so that the community is able to identify, prevent and respond to abusive and exploitative situations.

4. The Ministry of Manpower, the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, and the Ministry of Social Affairs should collaborate and provide technical assistance to the provincial and district level counterparts in designing anti-trafficking programmes using the 3P (Prevention, Protection and Prosecution) approach while mainstreaming gender sensitivity and addressing social norms in their programmes.

5. Local government agencies should promote the leadership of women in formal spaces, such as local government departments and agencies, and in village community leadership positions.

6. The BP2MI (Agency for the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers) should extend, adapt and deliver their pre-departure orientation programme to the Sumba region to promote gender mainstreaming and support the empowerment of women migrant workers.

7. All counterparts should further investigate the push factors for increasing migration of women and specifically look at the factors that contribute to the high number of irregular migrations.

8. Central and local government agencies to review the requirements acquiring permissions and authorizations from heads of villages and next of kin through a gender lens, so that they do not unfairly burden women more than men.

9. The Ministry of Manpower to conduct financial empowerment training and awareness-raising programmes for potential migrants, returnees, and their family members. These programmes should focus on effective financial and resource management strategies, such as investing in activities which can generate financial returns, as well as encourage more gender equitable decision-making processes in the family.

10. Local government agencies to follow up the effective implementation and enforcement of MoUs between them and religious and cultural leaders to eliminate practices that place women and children in dangerous positions because of "adat".

Weaknesses in governance structures that support migrants

Governance structures that serve aspiring migrant workers, including responses to trafficking risks, as mandated by local and national frameworks, require strengthening as they are stretched relative to the demand and need. Stretched services lead to governance gaps and may well be incentivizing irregular migration practices which circumvent regulatory safeguards put in place to protect migrant workers.

One of the key barriers to regular migration in Sumba are the administrative challenges in securing formal identification documents. This is primarily compounded by the low rate of birth registration in Sumba. This gap in governance results in reliance on the service of the recruitment agent to navigate or circumvent the bureaucratic barriers. These gaps leave both prospective and returning migrants with few avenues for authentication of documents and any related protections.

Furthermore, where these documents are falsified in order to enable irregular migration, people may face a barrier in accessing social protection. The consequences of the absence of formal and genuine identification with their communities may, in turn, negatively impact the migrants' safe return to, and reintegration into their community. The absence of

formal identification was also found to enable the risks of child labour, as underage girls can obtain falsified documents that show them to be older than they are and therefore qualified to migrate for work. The effects of using false identity documents also include stripping a migrant of her genuine identity, denying her the rights of a child, disconnecting her ties to the community and preventing her access to social protection rights from the outset of her migration cycle. Risks from falsified identification documents also include the difficulty for families to trace migrants who are abroad and are difficult to contact, and in cases when repatriating a worker home while abroad.

Limited intervention for returnee migrants in Sumba

Weaknesses in governance were also identified in the services and interventions available for returnee migrants, including those experiencing trafficking and exploitation, which are limited and ad hoc. The main reasons for these are the significant lack of financial and human resource capacity of local government entities mandated to protect migrant workers, such as the local anti-trafficking task forces (ATTF). The lack of such formal protections, services and responses, means that there is a higher reliance on informal structures of community and family in dealing with any challenging migration events and experiences. This, in turn, can leave victims of trafficking and other returnee migrants to deal with social and community dynamics without professional help.

Government responses to trafficking in persons are further hindered by notable institutional technical capacity constraints. One key area identified is the lack of disaggregated data on trafficking and migration at local and national levels. Where statistics on trafficking and migration exist, the data differs between various government agencies. The lack of data and its inconsistencies contribute to a mismatch in planning priorities between national and provincial governments. Certain databases, such as police data, only includes reported cases of trafficking, other databases may only include those migrants which are appropriately registered. This results in significant gaps between datasets across which none are broken down by sex, age or other useful identifiers to allow for comparison and cross referencing. Consequently, a lack of institutional capacity to draw a complete picture of the issues leads to an inability to formulate and budget for strategic, evidence-based responses.

RECOMMENDATIONS

11. Local government district offices should establish or re-establish local ATTFs in order to improve the coordination of improved identification, referral and reintegration processes of victims of trafficking.

12. Local governments, through the established ATTF, to work with IOM to enhance data gathering and analysis on trafficking, migration and reintegration processes.

13. National ATTF and relevant local governments (through local ATTFs) should develop a local action plan on trafficking, which includes interventions for returnee migrant workers.

14. Central government should improve access to marriage and birth registration, as well as identification cards, at the grassroots level through coordination with existing local public and non-governmental organizations. This should also include increasing the quota of ID provisions.

15. National ATTF to establish a multi-sectoral MoU that standardizes data on migration and trafficking at national and district levels, and establishes a data-sharing mechanism.

Social stigmatization impacts returnee migrants experiences and their disconnect from support services

A "successful migration" was found to be understood and perceived as relative to other factors, rather than in absolute terms. A migration was found to be "successful" by family and community members when it was characterized by ostentatious displays of wealth by returnee migrants, usually linked to the performance of cultural rituals among village communities. In contrast, an "unsuccessful" migration involving distressing experiences abroad was not spoken about by the returnee. In turn, those who did share their negative experiences with family members found that their families did not speak about these with others in order to prevent "embarrassment" ("budaya malu") in the community. The view that

failed migration is a collective family responsibility can explain why an individual migrant may feel a great burden to be successful as they know that failure may reflect badly on their family.

When coupled with the expectation for women to have a "successful migration" experience, social norms that identify women as weak, subversive and in need of protection shape the way migrants perceive their experiences abroad and how they respond to those experiences once they return to Sumba. This research showed that women migrants often normalize the violence and poor labour practices they experienced while abroad. While the research did not specifically look into issues of abuse and violence in the community and other institutional spheres, it found that violence was often downplayed when it occurs in the context of labour migration due to the social conditioning and expectations on women. Conditioning women to accept violence and exploitative labour practices as normal have an impact on migrants' assistance-seeking behaviour. This was evidenced in the noticeable reticence among returnee migrants with respect to seeking redress or assistance for the rights violations they experienced after returning to Sumba.

Stigmatization of returnee migrants

Gender significantly influences how returnee migrants and any perceived failure of their migration are received by their communities. Migrating for work challenges social and familial expectations of gender-based division of labour and women as nurturers of children. Whereas women seeking to migrate perceive themselves as agents of economic change for their families, others may see them as neglecting their nurturing domestic role and responsible for the breakdown of their family as well as their potential abuse.

This research also yielded varied responses about the stigmatization of returnee migrants. Of note, many of those expressing stigmatized views of women migrants were government officials. However, a number of government officials who were interviewed also shared a different perspective, noting how women are often encouraged to migrate due to the patriarchal view that they were there to serve the men. Furthermore, women who migrate must prepare themselves for the possibility that their husbands would leave them and their children will not be taken care of. Women migrant's exercise of agency by choosing to migrate is sometimes deemed as being responsible for the disintegration of the family unit and therefore worthy of punishment. The negative implications for women returning without adequate financial resources to show for their time away is the attribution of such "failure" on their character and a consequence of their resistance to paternalistic power structures.

Of particular relevance and interest, communities perceived the stigmatization of returnee migrants to be temporary, and that they valued the return of their members above all. In light of this finding, further research is required to understand the temporal dimension of stigmatization, and the extent to which other factors, including the behaviour and actions of the returnee migrant, also impact the reintegration experiences of returnee migrants.

RECOMMENDATIONS

16. District Offices of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection to set up "support groups" for returnees (separated for males and females). Such support groups can also be offered access to local assistance and services, such as shelters, and income generation activities.

17. Central government and collaborating agencies could further enquire into how migrants experience stigma over time and what specific events and attitudes lead to its dissipation.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 RESEARCH RATIONALE AND FOCUS

This report explores how social norms and stigma can be drivers of vulnerability to trafficking and barriers to effective reintegration of survivors in West Sumba and South-west Sumba, Indonesia. The research was undertaken to support IOM's "Assessing Stigma for Prevention, Improved Response and Evidence Base (ASPIRE)" project in Indonesia. It explores the ways in which social pressures and expectations that are put on people to migrate, in turn, heighten the risk of trafficking and exploitation of individuals, particularly women. These social pressures and expectations are presented in the context of cultural traditions and generational conditioning, with their impact on contemporary life. The research also builds understanding on how the roles played by family members, communities and service providers, due to historical norms and influences, shape agency and access of returnee migrant women to service providers in Indonesia.

An assessment of literature was undertaken to prepare a conceptual foundation to inform the research and identify any gaps in information and evidence.[1] The existing research and literature revealed that tensions, strains and conflicts in familial and community relationships often emerge during the reintegration process for returnee migrants. Furthermore, the stigmatization associated with migration outcomes that are not successful are amplified at the community level in comparison to within the family. Returnee women are especially likely to carry feelings of shame, guilt and a sense of responsibility for any perceived failure if the migration does not result in remittances, because their decision to migrate is perceived as already breaching traditional gender roles and standards of good parenting.

However, empirical studies are limited on the influence of this stigma on assistance-seeking behaviour for trafficked persons during the reintegration process, and how it affects a victim's exposure to vulnerabilities that drive re-migration and re-trafficking in South-East Asia. There also remains a gap in the literature on how stigma plays out with service providers at the community level, the ways this dynamic affects the quality of available reintegration assistance, and the various manifestations of stigma in service provision to trafficked survivors. Existing scholarship on post-trafficking reintegration in this region has tended to focus on experiences, viewed from the perspectives of individuals who were trafficked and not on service providers, who live within the social context of victims.

For these reasons, this research focuses on identifying and understanding the role of social norms and stigma as drivers for people's decisions to migrate unsafely, which in turn increase their vulnerability to trafficking. It also seeks to understand the practical as well as behavioural barriers to reintegration and access to effective service provision. The overarching emphasis of the report is on examining the realities of these dynamics on the ground through an in-depth case study of West Sumba and South-west Sumba, Indonesia.

This report consists of five sections. The first section describes the conceptual framework used in this research, including the definitions of social norms, stigma and reintegration, and an overview of how these concepts are applied to assess their impact on trafficking victims. The second section details the methodology, location sites, ethical considerations and limitations of the research. The third section provides an overview of the broader economic, political, and sociocultural context in Indonesia that is pertinent to understanding the drivers of unsafe migration and the trafficking situation in the country. The fourth section presents the primary research findings and analysis of the social norms and stigma around the following identified themes: the unchallenged narrative of migration as "positive" and "aspirational"; the impact of gender-based social norms on migration choices and outcomes; weaknesses in government structures that support migrants; and the impact of social stigmatization on returnee migrants' experiences and their disconnect from support services. Case studies are also presented to provide context to the findings. Building on respondents' stories about their lived realities, each section concludes with policy and programming recommendations for governments, CSOs, NGOs and media. Section five of the report then concludes with final remarks about the findings.

[1] This is based on the literature review undertaken as part of this research. A list of literature reviewed is available in Annex II.

1.2 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

This research applies the concepts of social norms and stigma to assess their impacts as drivers of unsafe migration and vulnerability to trafficking. It further examines the impacts of social norms and stigma as practical and behavioural barriers of returnee migrants' reintegration and access to effective service provision.

1.2.1 Social norms

Social norms are behavioural rules (usually informal and unwritten) on what is considered acceptable and appropriate behaviour within a group or given society. They can be classified as "descriptive norms", which are what other people do, and "injunctive norms", which are what others approve of. Descriptive norms are when a person observes the behaviour of others in the group and follows suit. Descriptive norms thereby help to prevent "social collision". On the other hand, injunctive norms are when a person sees how others react to compliance or non-compliance with the norm and thereby form beliefs about what should be done. Injunctive norms enable people to build "alliances" through gaining social approval. Ultimately, people usually *"comply with the norm because they anticipate social rewards for doing so and social punishments for not complying"*.[2]

Social norms vary across cultural contexts, as do the strength or influence of particular norms. Some communities might be more lenient about compliance, while others, particularly in small, isolated rural communities, may tolerate very little divergence. In such contexts, social norms exert strong influence and result in social sanctions for transgression.[3]

In the context of migration and trafficking, social norms can influence the likelihood of migration as well as who migrates (considering factors such as gender, age and sibling birth order). It also affects experiences of reintegration, with some returnees unable or unwilling to comply with social norms due to life-altering experiences abroad. Therefore, it is essential to understand what culturally entrenched social norms exist and interplay in a community where a social change or development intervention is being implemented. Identifying where social norms might act as roadblocks, as well as how existing local cultural values and worldviews can be leveraged, will impact the success of any programme or service intervention.

1.2.2 Stigma

The term "stigma" was originally used to refer to the markings on Greek slaves, separating them from free citizens.[4] More recently, stigma is used in the wider sense to refer to social disapproval, and reactions and attitudes towards what is considered to be disgraceful or defective. The concept of stigma generally falls into two categories – "felt stigma" and "enacted stigma".[5] Felt stigma refers to the *"shame and expectation of discrimination that prevents people from talking about their experiences and stops them seeking help"*.[6] Enacted stigma is the *"experience of unfair treatment by others"*.[7] Because reintegration occurs on multiple levels – both at the individual, the family and community levels[8] – felt stigma and enacted stigma are equally harmful to the successful reintegration of trafficked persons.

An effective response to the health and psychosocial needs of victims of trafficking requires adequate understanding of and support in navigating the complex social process of "returning home". For many, the experience of stigma is a confronting reality and can be caused by a complex social process of social norms interacting with the perceived behaviour and merit of the returnee.

Trafficked persons live with prevailing stereotypes, negative attitudes and discrimination associated with trafficking. Such narratives of trafficking survivors not only provide insight into their perspective as victims living with stigma as part of their social context, but also raise deeper questions about how stigma shapes coping strategies and assistance-seeking behaviour during reintegration.[9] Accessing available services is a complex process, as trafficked persons must not only

[2] Cislaghi B., Manji K, Heise L., 2018. Social Norms and Gender-related Harmful Practices, Learning Report 2: Theory in support of better practice. Learning Group on Social Norms and Gender-related Harmful Practices, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, pp. 1–23.
[3] Ibid.
[4] Gray, A.J., 2002. Stigma in psychiatry. Journal of the Royal Society of Medicine [online]. 95(2), pp. 72–76.
[5] Scrambler, G., 1998. Stigma and disease: changing paradigms. The Lancet. 352(9133), pp. 1054–1055.
[6] Gray, A.J., 2002. Stigma in psychiatry. Journal of the Royal Society of Medicine [online]. 95(2), pp. 72–76.
[7] Ibid.
[8] Fonseca, A., Hart, L. and Klink, S., 2015. Reintegration: effective approaches. International Organization for Migration, p. 13.
[9] Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R., 2007. Leaving the past behind: When victims of trafficking decline assistance. Oslo: Fafo, pp. 123–133.

come to terms with the exploitation and violence they suffered, but also do it in the public eye, among family and the wider community.[10] Part of the reintegration process is therefore anticipating, and confronting stigma associated with trafficked persons and their experiences.

Therefore, consideration is always required into what precisely causes stigma – whether it is due to failing to provide remittances to support the family, leaving home, being a victim of sexual violence, or other factors. In addition, the degree of stigma can be affected by the extent to which the victim is seen as culpable, whether their status and belonging within a family or community are impacted, and whether different forms of trafficking are less stigmatizing, for example, forced labour compared to sexual exploitation.[11]

1.2.3 Reintegration

There is no agreed definition for "reintegration" but it generally refers to the *"re-inclusion or re-incorporation of a person into a group or a process, for example, of a migrant into the society of their country of origin".*[12] However, it cannot be assumed that re-entering one's country of origin and into its society is necessarily a "homecoming" or returning to something familiar. Reintegration is considered as "complete" or "sustainable" when those who return are able to participate meaningfully in the economic and social structure of the country of origin.[13] Integral to this is the ability to be economically self-sufficient, have stable social ties with the community and have levels of physical and psychosocial well-being that allows further migration decisions to be made out of choice, and not necessity.[14] Reintegration programmes or services such as those that provide job training or placement, legal assistance, healthcare, psychosocial support and prevent stigmatization are intended to facilitate the process for *"overall social and economic recovery"* of a trafficked person.[15]

Reintegration happens at different levels, and various factors culminate to determine its success.[16] It involves changes in economic and social strategies and positioning of the returnee in relation to kin, community and the wider structural or external environment. At the individual level or personal level, successful reintegration is affected by factors such as sex, gender, class, education level, social networks, family's financial or social standing and the person's emotional, psychological and physical well-being.[17] Also influential is the nature of the returnee's journey and trafficking experience. Factors such as length of absence, the nature and severity of exploitation experienced, the support services received prior to return and the level of preparedness for return also impact the outcome of reintegration.

At the same time, reintegration also takes place at the community level where a spectrum of cultural and social norms, gender roles and perceptions and attitudes in relation to migration, trafficking and returnees are expressed. At this level, returnees, with their transformed notions of identity, community and home, may find support, social networks and resources to facilitate recovery on one hand, and face resentment, stigmatization and exclusion on the other.[18] Finally, reintegration occurs at the broader external environmental or structural level. Here, reintegration is influenced by political, economic, social, and institutional conditions at the local, national and international level.[19] The ability to reintegrate is determined by the availability and accessibility of assistance services, the employment market and local and national government competencies.

1.2.4 An overview of how social norms and stigma impact trafficking victims

Labour migrants' aspirations are integrally connected to those of their family and community, to improve their collective socioeconomic standing. Many will have made significant investments, both financial and familial, in order to travel away from home to seek a better income. It is therefore not surprising to find that tensions, strains and conflicts in familial and community relationships emerge when migrants return home without the much aspired for achievements and earnings. For victims of trafficking, such socially complex conflicts and tensions can be particularly profound during the reintegration process. This subsection sets out several key general themes identified through existing knowledge and literature.

[10] Ibid.
[11] Ibid.
[12] Fonseca, A., Hart, L., and Klink, S., 2015. Reintegration: effective approaches. International Organization for Migration, pp. 1–40.
[13] Graviano, N., Götzelmann, A., Nozarian, N. and Jawadurovna Wadud, A., 2017. Towards an integrated approach to reintegration in the context of return. Switzerland: International Organization for Migration.
[14] IOM, 2019. Reintegration Handbook: Practical guidance on the design, implementation and monitoring of reintegration assistance. Accessed 31 July 2020. Available at https://publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/iom_reintegration_handbook.pdf.
[15] Ibid.
[16] Graviano, N., et al., 2017. Towards an integrated approach to reintegration in the context of return.
[17] Ibid.
[18] Surtees, R., 2017. Moving on. Family and Community Reintegration Among Indonesian Trafficking Victims.
[19] Graviano, N., et al., 2017. Towards an integrated approach to reintegration in the context of return.

Shame and Blame

As mentioned, labour migrants and their families the world over, commonly make significant sacrifices, both financial and familial. Financial investments may consist of taking on debt in order to fund the migrant's journey. Familial sacrifices inevitably include both the loss of a family member's presence and domestic labour. Where expectations of remittances or the return of the migrant with significant funds is not met, family reunions may be fraught with feelings of shame, guilt and a sense of responsibility.[20] For women, the sense of guilt, shame and failure is worsened because the decision to migrate is perceived as already breaching traditional gender roles and standards of good parenting.[21] [22] Whether or not the migration involved trafficking is not always understood or appreciated in the family.

Stigmatization at community level for "failed migration"

As will be outlined in the research findings below, blame and shame may take the form of stigmatization at the community level. Victims of trafficking are often criticized for perceived character flaws – for having misspent or squandered their salary, not working hard enough abroad on one hand, and being over-ambitious, aiming too high, not being satisfied and wanting a higher salary on the other.[23] Others suffer discrimination because of the consequences of activities trafficked persons are forced to do – prostitution, getting pregnant, being arrested as irregular migrants – that run counter to cultural norms.[24] People are blamed for the violence and exploitation they experienced. In general, the "failure" of the trafficked person to uphold their end of the bargain (e.g. to remit money, to bring home money and gifts and to improve the economic standing of the family) is perceived as a personal deficiency and not the malfunctioning of wider systems or institutions.

Stigmatization for being trafficked

To navigate both the felt and enacted stigma associated with trafficking, many choose either not to reveal the full extent of their trafficking experiences to family members or to keep it a secret.[25] Women who were victims of sex trafficking, for instance, said that they stayed indoors to avoid inquiries from community members[26] and avoided speaking to immediate family members about their trafficking experience to evade being viewed as a "prostitute" or being blamed for what happened.[27] Others choose to dress more conservatively so as not to be perceived as being a sex worker.[28] The linking of migration and trafficking with sex work reveals existing assumptions and prejudices about women's migration, trafficking, and sex work.[29] In some cases, women's long absence from home as a result of trafficking leads to familial relationship breakdowns, evidenced in divorces or separations.

Coping strategies and isolation

Such narratives of trafficking survivors provide insight into how stigma also shapes coping strategies and assistance-seeking behaviour during reintegration. Coping strategies that involve keeping trafficking experiences secret or invisible, risk isolating the victim from social support systems within their family and community.[30] It creates a barrier by preventing victims from reaching out for formal or informal services for fear of exposing their trafficking experiences to public scrutiny.[31] An example of a study on trafficked persons' assistance-seeking behaviour focused on victims in Eastern Europe. The research found that some victims who had not told their families about what they have been through found it difficult to accept assistance. Consequently, family members are sceptical of the assistance being offered and the reasons for why it is offered.[32]

Stigmatization by service providers

Empirical studies have yet to fully address the influence of stigma on assistance-seeking behaviour for trafficked persons during the reintegration process, and how it affects a victim's exposure to vulnerabilities that drive re-migration and re-

[20] Surtees, R., 2017. Moving on. Family and Community Reintegration Among Indonesian Trafficking Victims. Nexus Institute. Accessed 27 August 2020. Available at https://nexushumantrafficking.files.wordpress.com/2015/02/moving-on-nexus-october-2017-compressed.pdf.
[21] Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R., 2013. Coming home: Challenges in family reintegration for trafficked women. Qualitative Social Work, 12(4), pp. 454–472.
[22] This is exacerbated where women are trafficked into sexual exploitation, which in turn hinders them from seeking assistance and support.
[23] Such reflections have been shared by ASEAN based victims of trafficking with the researchers over the years working in service provision and case response.
[24] Ibid.
[25] Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R., 2013. Coming home: Challenges in family reintegration for trafficked women, pp. 454–472.
[26] Le, P.D., 2017. "Reconstructing a Sense of Self" Trauma and Coping Among Returned Women Survivors of Human Trafficking in Vietnam. Qualitative health research, 27(4), pp. 509–519.
[27] Ibid
[28] Surtees, R., 2017. Moving on. Family and Community Reintegration Among Indonesian Trafficking Victims.
[29] Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R., 2007. Leaving the past behind: When victims of trafficking decline assistance. Oslo: Fafo, pp. 123–133.
[30] Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R., 2013. Coming home: Challenges in family reintegration for trafficked women. pp. 454–472.
[31] Aberdein, C. and Zimmerman, C., 2015. Access to mental health and psychosocial services in Cambodia by survivors of trafficking and exploitation: a qualitative study. International journal of mental health systems, 9(1), p. 16.
[32] Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R., 2007. Leaving the past behind: When victims of trafficking decline assistance, pp. 123–133.

trafficking. The literature is also lacking on how stigma plays out with service providers at the community level, and the ways that affects the quality of available reintegration assistance or the various manifestations of stigma in service provision to trafficked survivors. Lessons can be drawn from research in other social protection fields on the linkages between stigma and service provision on health-related conditions or specific diseases, and the various practical manifestations of stigma. Expressions of stigma range from *"outright denial of care, provision of sub-standard care, physical and verbal abuse, to more subtle forms, such as making certain people wait longer or passing their care off to junior colleagues"*.[33]

Drivers, manifestations and consequences of stigma, however, are context dependent. Understanding them in the context of service provision and from the perspective of service providers for reintegration of trafficked persons is important. Like trafficked persons, service providers, too, live with prevailing stereotypes, negative attitudes and discrimination associated with trafficking. Adequate and accessible services are critical to the prevention of re-trafficking as well as unsafe re-migration. In this regard, understanding stigma and its interaction with assistance-seeking and assistance-providing behaviour for trafficking is important for strengthening the delivery of equitable and quality services while attending to the specific needs of trafficking victims, as well as identifying gaps for stigma prevention and reduction.

[33] Nyblade, L., Stockton, M.A., Giger, K., Bond, V., Ekstrand, M.L., Mc Lean, R., Mitchell, E.M., La Ron, E.N., Sapag, J.C., Siraprapasiri, T. and Turan, J., 2019. Stigma in health facilities: why it matters and how we can change it. BMC medicine, 17(1), pp. 1–15.

2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND TOOLS

2.1 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A mixed method approach was utilized, consisting of a literature review, online consultations, key informant interviews (KIIs), focus group discussions (FGDs), and field observations. Due to the social complexity of studying stigma and social norms, community-based research was undertaken using qualitative methods allowing for in-depth explorations and conversations with target informants. A total of 48 participants took part in this research. The following outlines the specific steps taken:

Initial briefing meetings:
Briefing meetings were undertaken with key IOM staff working on the ASPIRE project to enhance the conceptual understanding of the research. This process was also important to complement the development of the research's methodological approach.

Literature review:
A review of selected literature was conducted to inform the conceptual framework and design of the research tools. The rapid literature review focused on the subject of trafficking, social norms, stigma, gender and reintegration, and was conducted in both English and Bahasa Indonesia. The literature reviewed included NGO reports, INGO reports and documents, independent scholarly articles as well as World Bank documents. A review of relevant laws and regulations, both nationally and internationally, was also undertaken. A full bibliography can be found in the annexes to this report.

Online consultations:
A total of number consultations were undertaken with stakeholders specializing in social protection in the area of trafficking in Indonesia. The duration of the consultations ranged from 1 to 1.5 hours.

Stakeholder interviews with mandate holders:
Fieldwork was conducted in Indonesia in November and December 2019. Narrative enquiry through conducting semi-structured interviews was used to collect data regarding the personal background characteristics of returnees and their family, migrant returnees' pre- and post-migration stages, in-destination experiences, attitudes towards migration, and existing psychosocial reintegration support systems. Interviews and discussions were conducted in Bahasa, Kodi, Loli and English based on the preference of the research participant.

A series of in-depth interviews were undertaken with strategic stakeholders from government at national (six) and district levels (six), migrant representatives' organizations (five) as well as community leaders (two). A journalist, a Sumba-based community organizer/leader and a recruitment agent were interviewed to understand their role in the context of information dissemination for the prevention of stigma. Of importance, interviews were held with seven women who had returned from foreign employment, and nine persons who had someone from their family who had migrated and had not yet returned home. Four of the nine family members interviewed were children under the ages of 18.[34]

A total of 48 respondents (25 male and 23 female) were interviewed for the purpose of this research. The following provides a breakdown of the participants interviewed:

- 7 female returnees
- 9 family members (5 adult relatives, including husbands or siblings – 3 male, 2 female, and 4 children and young people – 1 boy, 3 girls)
- 2 male village heads
- 21 government officials (12 male, 9 female)
- 1 male NGO staff and 1 female NGO staff
- 3 male FBO staff and 1 female FBO staff
- 1 male journalist
- 1 male recruitment agent
- 1 male community organizer

[34] Children and young people interviewed were aged 17, 12 and 8 years old.

Data gathered from the research was thematically analyzed to understand both the situation of migrants and survivors of trafficking, as well as the frameworks, assumptions and relationships between principal stakeholders. Particular attention was paid to the ways in which each perceived the other stakeholders, in order to develop an idea of the landscape that is held in their minds that then influence their attitudes and actions.

A full list of organizations that participated in the research can be found in Annex III.

Validation Meetings:
A presentation and executive summary of the key findings and recommendations were presented to government stakeholders, CSO and NGO staff who participated in the research for their feedback and clarification. A two-hour online meeting was held with these stakeholders in July 2020.

2.2 FIELDWORK LOCATION SITES

Against this backdrop, the IOM commissioned this research aimed at assessing how social norms and stigma can be drivers of vulnerability to trafficking and barriers to effective reintegration of victims. The region of Sumba, East Nusa Tenggara was selected for the study by IOM due to several reasons, namely:

i) being a known source area for out-migration and trafficking;
ii) being considered as a region with its own unique culture, language and ethnicity; and
iii) being one of the least understood regions of Indonesia in terms of trends of trafficking.

East Nusa Tenggara (NTT) is the southernmost province of Indonesia. It consists of more than 500 islands with one of the largest ones being Sumba. Sumba, as well as the whole province of NTT is predominantly Christian. Sumba has a high poverty rate as a result of the province's lack of resources, its remote location and dependence on low agricultural income; these factors have contributed to stagnant economic growth in Sumba.[35] Land in Sumba is widely available, but its soil lacks fertility. Despite this, agriculture has been a main source of income for the Sumbanese. Growing of food crops for consumption, rearing livestock for its meat and eggs, keeping cattle for ceremonial purposes and for tilling the land all constitute activities that support subsistence in Sumba.[36]

Although the official language of NTT is Bahasa Indonesia, the region has a rich tapestry of local languages. At least 72 local languages have been identified by the Ministry of Education and Culture. Languages spoken are based on ethnicity. In South-west Sumba, the languages of Gaura, Kodi, Lamboya, Loli and Wewewa (Wejewa) are spoken, and in West Sumba, Gaura Lamboya, Loli and Wanukaka (Wanokaka) are spoken.[37] In the specific research target locations, the local languages of Kodi and Loli were spoken in addition to the national language of Bahasa.

Figure 1. Map of Indonesia highlighting in red the locations where the field research took place

Note: This map is for illustration purposes only. The boundaries and names shown and the designations used on this map do not imply official endorsement or acceptance by the International Organization for Migration.

[35] Vel, J.A., 2008. Uma politics; An ethnography of democratization in west Sumba, Indonesia, 1986-2006 (pp. XVII-277). Brill.
[36] Ibid.
[37] Ministry of Education and Culture, Centre for Language and Book Development and Protection. Accessed 20 September 2020. Available at https://petabahasa.kemdikbud.go.id/mapEnlarge2.php?idp=24.

Jakarta, West Sumba and South-west Sumba were the areas chosen to fulfil the scope of the research. Jakarta was chosen as a fieldwork site because it is the capital city of Indonesia where many government officials, NGOs and FBOs are clustered. West Sumba and South-west Sumba were chosen locations for fieldwork because despite these areas having high levels of outward migration, relatively little is known about the needs of victims of trafficking. Many returnee migrant workers (some of whom are expected to be survivors of trafficking) are also clustered within these localities.

2.3 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Given the sensitive nature of this assessment's subject matter and the experience of serious physical, psychological and emotional traumas of returnees, ethical considerations and safety precautions were established and implemented to ensure the protection and well-being of the research participants. A careful research design that adhered to ethical guidelines[38] helped to avoid potential harm to the participants' current and future lives. Furthermore, the researchers involved in collecting the data were selected based on their experience of interviewing and working with vulnerable groups.

Informed Consent: The explicit consent of participants was obtained prior to conducting the interview. The purpose of the research, the uses of the findings, as well as the conditions of participation were explained to the research participants, both verbally and in written format.[39] Participation was voluntary, with participants having the authority to refuse to partake in the research, as well as the full right to decline answering any questions and withdraw at any time during the interview. Consent forms were signed by all participants that partook in the research. A copy of the consent form (English version) can be found in Annex IV.

Privacy and Confidentiality: The privacy of the participants was promoted, and all interviews with returnee migrants and their families were undertaken in their homes or in spaces deemed comfortable for the returnees, such as at the homes of their neighbours. Interviews with returnee migrants were conducted separately from interviews with family members, unless stipulated by the returnee that they wanted their family member present. No government or IOM staff were allowed to be present during the interviews or FGDs with returnees, family members or local leaders.

Anonymity: In order to protect informants, names and roles are not used in referring to the data gathered. No identifying photos of survivors of trafficking and returnee migrants or their family members have been used in the research. Photos of other stakeholders who participated in the research have only been taken and featured where explicit written consent has been provided. The names of participants featured in the case studies throughout this report have all been changed to pseudonyms, with asterisks denoting their hidden identity.

Participant Safety: Confidential data in relation to this assignment (both soft and hard copy formats) were stored according to IOM's Data Protection Principles and made accessible only to relevant Embode and IOM team members. In addition, the identity of each research participant was removed from the data by the researchers before sharing with the project team.

Child Protection: Interviews with children were conducted in accordance with Embode's and IOM's Child Protection Policies.

Sensitively Framed Questions and Questioning Techniques: A delicate balance was maintained to ensure that the necessary information was collected but without causing undue distress or stress for participants. Attention was given to phrase questions using local vocabulary and easy-to-understand terminology. Emphasis was put on making the FGDs conversational and participatory, and care was taken for interviews to not be overly interviewer-driven but for respondents to tell their own stories.

[38] This included 'Forced Migration Review – Ethics Issue: exploring ethical questions that confront our work', 'The IOM Handbook on Direct Assistance for Victim of Trafficking', UNICEF's 'Ethical Research Involving Children' and Embode's Code of Conduct.

[39] Bahasa Indonesia was used with the exception of two participants who did not speak Bahasa Indonesia and who were interviewed in the local language.

2.4 LIMITATIONS

There were a number of limitations encountered in undertaking this assessment.

Inaccessibility of male migrant returnees: The researchers were unable to interview male returnees. The ratio of female to male migration in Sumba ranges from 10:1, 9:1, 5:1,[40] reflecting the gendered nature of migration in the area. Due to the low numbers of male migrants, it was difficult for the community organizer engaged by the team to source male returnees for interviewing. Two male workers were initially identified for the interviews, however, they were unavailable at the last minute.

Small sample size: The time frame available for conducting the field research was narrow. The multiple site locations were geographically dispersed, which meant a substantial time was spent travelling between them. In addition, in order to understand of the stigma and social norms, the researchers needed to engage different stakeholders across families, community leaders, government and CSOs. This meant that a total of only 7 returnee migrants could be interviewed during the field research.

Geographic locations of research: The study locations were selected due to being hotspot areas of outward migration, and hence results cannot be indiscriminately extended to the country as a whole. There are significant cultural, religious and economic differences between the states, districts and even townships and villages in Indonesia, and these factors all impact the prevalence of migration, the people who migrate, the routes they take, the risks they face, and the way they are received back into families and communities. Therefore, whilst some of the findings may be reflective of the situation nationally, other aspects are likely to be specific to the particular locations that were researched.

[40] The ratio of women to men migrants differed according to the government agencies in the targeted districts who were interviewed for this research. These figures were 10:1, 9:1, and 5:1, which were provided by the Office of Social Affairs in West Sumba, Office of Manpower in West Sumba, and the Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection in South-west Sumba, respectively.

3. OVERVIEW OF INDONESIA

3.1 COUNTRY CONTEXT

Located in South-East Asia, Indonesia is the world's largest archipelago with approximately 17,000 islands, spanning 5,120 km from east to west. Home to over 260 million people and more than 300 ethnic groups, Indonesia is the world's fourth most populous nation.[41] Since the 1997–1998 Asian Financial Crisis, Indonesia has undergone remarkable social and economic transformations, transitioning to a democratic state and growing to become South-East Asia's largest economy and a member of the G-20. The country's gross domestic product (GDP) per capita has risen from USD 823 in 2000 to USD 3,932 in 2018.[42] Steady economic growth during this period was driven by structural transformation of industries from agriculture to services. Of note, a majority of service workers are concentrated in trade, restaurants and hotels, where large numbers of women workers are employed.[43] This growth has helped Indonesia make significant gains in poverty reduction, reducing Indonesia's poverty rate significantly from 24% in 1999 to 9.8% in 2018.[44]

Despite sustained economic growth and gains in poverty alleviation, Indonesia's social indicators also paint a picture of various development challenges facing the country. For example, Indonesia's maternal mortality rate is among the highest in South-East Asia, with 126 maternal deaths for every 100,000 live births.[45] Meanwhile, approximately 1 in 3 children under the age of 5 suffer from stunting, which impairs brain development and affects future opportunities.[46]

Indonesia's income inequality is also climbing. The benefits and opportunities associated with the country's economic growth have not been shared widely across the population. Even as the poverty rate falls, approximately 25.9 million Indonesians still live below the poverty line and 20.19% of the population is vulnerable to falling into poverty as their income levels are just above the national poverty line.[47] In 2014, the richest 10% of Indonesians consume as much as the poorest 54%, growing from 42% in 2002.[48]

Income inequality in Indonesia is also gendered. Indonesia is ranked 88th on the World Economic Forum's Gender Gap Index. Of the 50 richest people in the country, only one is a woman.[49] Economic inequality is compounded by high levels of gender inequality. Gender inequality means women are less likely to have decision-making power or influence over their own lives and over how resources are allocated in households and in society. Women and girls generally face discrimination in access to education and have fewer economic assets. Further, the work that women do is systemically undervalued; women are disproportionately represented in lowest-paid and unpaid roles and informal sectors, making them more vulnerable to poverty.

3.2 LABOUR MIGRATION FOR POVERTY ALLEVIATION

For many in Indonesia, and for women in particular, labour migration is a poverty alleviation strategy, and a way of improving economic and social standing in their communities. There are more than 9 million Indonesians working overseas; this accounts for almost 7% of the country's total labour force.[50] Almost two thirds of Indonesian migrant workers come from districts in relatively poorer regions where average poverty rates are higher than the national average.[51] According to the Agency for the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers (BP2MI)'s data, 70% of Indonesian documented[52] migrant workers in 2017 and 2018 were women,[53] the majority of whom are employed as domestic workers.

[41] World Bank, 2020. Overview. World Bank. Accessed 3 September 2020. Available at https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/indonesia/overview.
[42] Ibid.
[43] International Labour Organization, 2011. Decent Work Profile Indonesia. Geneva: International Labour Organization. Accessed 6 September 2020. Available at www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---integration/documents/publication/wcms_167418.pdf.
[44] Asian Development Bank, 2020. Indonesia and ADB. Asian Development Bank. Accessed 22 August 2020. Available at https://www.adb.org/countries/indonesia/ overview.
[45] UNICEF, 2016. Maternal and Newborn Health Disparities Indonesia. UNICEF. Accessed 21 August 2020. Available at https://data.unicef.org/resources/maternal-newborn-health-disparities-country-profiles/.
[46] World Bank, 2020. Overview. World Bank. Accessed 3 September 2020. Available at https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/indonesia/overview.
[47] Ibid.
[48] World Bank, 2016. Indonesia's Rising Divide. Washington: The World Bank. Accessed 2 September 2020. Available at http://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/267671467991932516/pdf/106070-WP-PUBLIC-Indonesias-Rising-Divide-English.pdf.
[49] Ibid.
[50] World Bank, 2017. "Indonesia's Global Workers: Juggling Opportunities & Risks. pp. 1–82.
[51] Ibid.
[52] As this figure is derived from official government data, this percentage may not include undocumented workers.
[53] Badan Nasional Penempatan Dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia, 2019. Data of placement in 2017 and 2018. Badan Nasional Penempatan Dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia. Accessed 23 April 2020. Available at http://portal.bnp2tki.go.id/stat_penempatan/indeks.

Labour migration offers the opportunity to enter the active workforce and earn higher remuneration relative to income potential in source areas. Furthermore, for many women migrant workers, a job abroad represents their first experience of paid work. A World Bank report found that the majority (70%) of former Indonesian migrant workers have improved economic standing after migration.[54] Meanwhile, women migrant workers who work abroad report that they can earn up to five times what they would expect to earn in Indonesia, after discounting the costs of migration.[55] Collectively, migrant labour contributed USD 10.97 billion in remittances to the Indonesian economy, or approximately 1% of the GDP, in 2018.[56] Research on remittances suggests that female migrants send almost the same amount of remittances as male migrants; however, women tend to send a higher proportion of their income, despite earning less than men at the global level.[57] Remittances contribute to improving longer-term economic outcomes for migrant workers and their families, when they are channelled towards education, business capital or savings. In addition to international labour migration, a large number of Indonesians also migrate internally for work.

3.3 UNSAFE MIGRATION AND TRAFFICKING IN INDONESIA

Notwithstanding the significant economic benefits in finding foreign employment, migration is a risky proposition. Migrants are exposed to various risks of violence and exploitation throughout the migration cycle, one of which is trafficking in persons. Consequently, the experience of unsafe migration might be seen as a continuum with safe labour migration on the one side and trafficking in persons on the other. Elements of trafficking, as defined by the United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (2000), a supplement of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime ("Palermo Protocol"), are highly likely to affect a migrant's journey – spanning recruitment during pre-migration to exploitation during transit and in countries of destination, and violence during repatriation or return and reintegration.

The "act" of trafficking, being *"recruitment, transportation, transferring, harbouring or receiving a person for exploitative purposes through threats, coercion, fraud, deception and other means,"*[58] may be enabled by a complex and interwoven web of migration intermediaries and service providers. These, in turn, range from families and friends, recruitment agents, travel agencies, state officials, and employers. Throughout the migration cycle, a person may be a migrant or a trafficked person, depending on where she or he is situated on this continuum.

Although trafficking of persons in Indonesia affects men, women and children, this report focuses only on unsafe migration and the trafficking of women and girls. This is because in the research focus area of Sumba, the vast majority of migrants identified were women. The feminization of migration in Indonesia is also a consequence of labour demands in professions traditionally considered or seen as women's work such as nannies, domestic workers, carers and so forth. It is from the pool of migrating women that trafficking occurs. Indonesia is primarily a source country for international trafficking, and a transit and destination country to a lesser extent. A significant number of Indonesians are exploited in forced labour in Asia and the Middle East.[59] Malaysia is the main destination for Indonesian migrant workers.[60] Women and girls are mostly trafficked into domestic work, sex work, forced, servile marriage or mail order marriages, and child labour.[61]

[54] Ibid.
[55] Ibid.
[56] Badan Nasional Penempatan Dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia, 2018. Data Penempatan dan Pelindungan Periode Tahun 2018 [online]. Jakarta: Pusat Penelitian Pengembangan dan Informasi (PUSLITFO). Accessed 25 May 2020. Available at http://portal.bnp2tki.go.id/uploads/data/data_12-03-2019_094615_Laporan_Pengolahan_Data_BNP2TKI_2018.pdf.
[57] International Organization for Migration, 2010. Gender, Migration and Remittances. Accessed 7 September 2020. Available at https://www.iom.int/sites/default/files/about-iom/Gender-migration-remittances-infosheet.pdf.
[58] United Nations Office on Drugs, Crime, Division for Treaty Affairs Staff, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. Division for Treaty Affairs, 2004. Legislative Guides for the Implementation of the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto. United Nations Publications.
[59] U.S. Department of State, 2018. 2018 Trafficking in Persons Report: Indonesia. Accessed 21 January 2020. Available at https://www.state.gov/reports/2018-trafficking-in-persons-report/indonesia/.
[60] Badan Pelindungan Pekerja Migran Indonesia, 2020. Data Penempatan dan Pelindungan PMI Periode Juli 2020. Jakarta: Pusat Data dan Informasi BP2MI. Accessed 7 September 2020. Available at https://bp2mi.go.id/uploads/statistik/images/data_28-08-2020_Laporan_Pengolahan_Data_BNP2TKI_JULI_2020.pdf.
[61] Agustinanto, F. and Rosenberg, R., 2003. Trafficking of Women and Children in Indonesia. Accessed 22 August 2020. Available at https://childhub.org/en/system/tdf/library/attachments/iomc_solidarity_centre_tra.pdf?file=1&type=node&id=16313.

3.4 STATE RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE REINTEGRATION OF TRAFFICKED PERSONS

Indonesia is party to the Palermo Protocol, which provides the legal and normative framework for addressing trafficking in persons. It defines trafficking in persons and stipulates the state responsibility for responding to trafficking. Discourse around state obligations with respect to the Palermo Protocol has centred on criminalizing human trafficking through national legislation, investigating cases of trafficking and punishing offenders. Much neglected is the responsibility of governments to protect trafficked persons, in particular, to facilitate the return, recovery and reintegration of trafficked persons into their own communities after exploitative experiences abroad.

State responsibility on reintegration is stipulated in article 6(3) of the Palermo Protocol. It provides that the state party of the protocol shall consider *"implementing measures to provide for the physical, psychological and social recovery of victims of trafficking in persons through the provision of appropriate housing, counselling and information, medical, psychological and material assistance and employment, educational and training opportunities. It is also the State's responsibility to provide for the physical safety of victims of trafficking within its territory."* In Indonesia, the scope of government's responsibility for providing reintegration assistance to trafficked persons is stated in the country's anti-trafficking law (Law 21/2007). With regard to the reintegration process, Article 52 of the Law 21/2007 mandates the provision of medical and social rehabilitation, return assistance, and social reintegration, including the requirement for the National and Provincial Government to establish shelters and trauma centres.[62]

3.5 INDONESIAN LEGISLATION ON PROTECTING VICTIMS OF TRAFFICKING

Indonesia's Law 21/ 2007 states that trafficking in persons, especially of women and children, is an act against human dignity and human rights. It defines the trafficking victim as *"a person suffering from psychological, mental, physical, sexual, economic, and/or social trauma caused by the criminal act of trafficking"* and provides that trafficked persons are entitled to various forms of assistance such as health care, temporary shelter and legal support services.[63] These services are provided to trafficked persons for their "rehabilitation", to facilitate recovery from the *"psychological, mental, physical, sexual, economic, and/or social trauma"* caused by trafficking.[64]

Article 51 of Law 21/2007 states that victims are entitled to "medical and social rehabilitation". "Medical rehabilitation" refers to restoring the victim to "normal" physical and psychological conditions", while "social rehabilitation" refers to the restoration to adequate or optimal mental health and the ability to return to social functions in order to carry out their role in the family and society. Social reintegration comprises the reunification of victims of trafficking in persons to the family or a foster family that can provide protection and fulfilment of the needs of the victims. The Law 21/2007 mandates the national and district governments to establish shelters for social protection and trauma centres. Article 48 provides that every victim of trafficking in persons or their heir is entitled to receive restitution. In detail, the provision of compensation, restitution, and assistance for the victims are regulated under Government Regulation 7/2018.

The Law 21/2007, as stated in Article 58, also mandates the formation of the National Anti-Trafficking Task Force (NATTF) that was already established under the Presidential Decree 69/2008. The NATTF is chaired by the Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture (Kemenko PMK, formerly known as the Coordinating Ministry for People's Welfare) while the operations and coordination of NATTF members are led by the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (MoWECP).[65] A similar task force is established at the regional levels (at province and district/city levels) with direct reporting lines to the Provincial Governor for the Provincial Anti-Trafficking Task Force (ATTF) and the Mayor or Regent for the district ATTF. As of 2018, 32 Provincial Task Forces and 238 District/City ATTFs have been formed at local levels.

[62] See Article 52 of Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 21, Year 2007 on The Eradication of the Criminal Act of Trafficking in Persons, Article 52. Accessed 19 January 2020. Available at www.warnathgroup.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/Indonesia-TIP-Law-2007.pdf.

[63] See Article 1(3) of Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 21, Year 2007 on The Eradication of the Criminal Act of Trafficking in Persons, Article 1(3). Accessed 19 January 2020. Available at www.warnathgroup.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/Indonesia-TIP-Law-2007.pdf.

[64] See Article 1(14) of Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 21, Year 2007 on The Eradication of the Criminal Act of Trafficking in Persons. Accessed 19 January 2020. Available at www.warnathgroup.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/Indonesia-TIP-Law-2007.pdf.

[65] The members comprise of the Ministry of Home Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Religious Affairs, Ministry of Law and Human Rights, Ministry of Transportation, Ministry of Manpower, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education and Culture, Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy, Ministry of Communication and Informatics, Ministry of National Development Planning, Ministry of Youth and Sports, Indonesian National Police, Attorney General Office of Republic of Indonesia, Agency for the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers, State Intelligence Agency, and Statistics Indonesia.

The MoWECP develops regulations that guide the practical implementation of the Law 21/2007. For example, it issued the Ministerial Decree 9/2009 that sets the minimum standard of services provided at Integrated Service Centres for witnesses and/or victims of trafficking in persons at the local level (district/city), and the Ministerial Regulation Number 22 of Year 2010 concerning Standard Operational Procedures for Integrated Assistance for Witnesses and/or Victims of Trafficking in Person. It outlines services that the Integrated Service Centre should provide for victims of trafficking. The provision of services includes the health and social rehabilitation of victims, as well as assistance with repatriation, reintegration, legal assistance for witnesses and/or victims of trafficking. Ministerial Decrees 10 and 11/2012 also provide technical guidance for local governments in establishing ATTFs and for the society and community on the prevention and assistance of TIP.

In addition to the Law 21/2007, Indonesia has a number of further laws relevant to protection such as the Law 18/2017 on Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers. The Law 18/2017 provides for harsher punishment such as longer prison terms and more substantial fines compared to the previous Law 39/2004 for any violation in the labour migration mechanism. The Ministerial Decree 9/2019 regulates the placement of Indonesian migrant workers, and the Ministerial Decree 10/2019 regulates the procedures for the provision of licenses to recruitment agencies. Indonesia's Child Protection law makes child trafficking a specific offence.[66] Other regulations provide for additional dimensions of protection.[67]

[66] Government Regulation in Lieu of Law 1/2016, which is the second amendment of the Law 23/2002 concerning Child Protection. The 2002 Child Protection Law was first amended by the Law 35/2014. The Government Regulation was made in lieu of law and in the consideration of the Child Protection Law not providing a deterrent effect and comprehensive prevention. The Government Regulation criminalizes child trafficking, and can be used together with the Law 21/2007 in the prosecution of perpetrators.

[67] For example, under Law 13/2006, replaced by Law 31/2014, the Agency for Protection of Witnesses and Victims through the law was established to protect victims, whistle blowers and experts in their disclosure of criminal acts.

4. RESEARCH FINDINGS

4.1 THE NARRATIVE OF MIGRATION AS "POSITIVE" AND "ASPIRATIONAL" REMAINS UNCHALLENGED

> **Migration is very good. It ensures the sustainability of our families.**
> *– Male family member of a migrant worker, West Sumba*

Labour migration in Sumba is seen as positive and aspirational across all stakeholders. From heads of villages, to every member of a family interviewed, every person talked about the opportunities of migrating for work, despite where risks were acknowledged. For example, even where every community member knew of at least one person who had migrated and not yet returned, all agreed that migration was a good thing. This section outlines the key underlying driver of economic need, and the enabling factor of persuasive agents in this resulting and widely held narrative.

4.1.1 Low economic prospects push labour migration

Most Sumbanese never travel to other islands, however, various factors – the infertility of the soil, lack of employment opportunities and low education attainment levels – have combined to push Sumbanese to travel to neighbouring areas, such as Bali and Kupang, and abroad for employment.[68] In 2018, NTT was ranked ninth in Indonesia in the highest number of registered workers deployed for overseas employment. Within NTT province, West Sumba and South-west Sumba saw the highest numbers of registered Indonesian workers for overseas employment after Kupang district. Most migrants from Sumba are women and migrate into sectors of work that reflect the stereotypical gendered division of labour. According to the Agency for the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers (BP2MI) in 2018, 88% of Sumbanese who migrate were women, a majority of whom worked in the informal sector as domestic workers.[69] 70% of those who migrated from NTT in 2018 were placed in Malaysia for employment.

FBO school in South-west Sumba. © Embode 2019

Education levels of those who migrate out of NTT are low, with more than half who migrate for overseas employment[70] only possessing a primary school certificate. According to a number of local stakeholders who were interviewed, low literacy rates are a push factor for out-migration due to those with low literacy becoming targets for recruitment by labour agencies. Migrants with low educational attainment are more likely to rely on and obtain information only from "middle-men" rather than from licensed agents, and are thereby more likely to be deceived and end up in situations of trafficking and exploitation.[71] Females with low levels of educational attainment are more likely migrate to Malaysia or the Middle East[72] for work, while higher educated females tend to migrate to more developed East Asian countries. The reason for these patterns is partly in response to the different minimum education requirements for these destination countries. For example, to be employed as a domestic worker in Hong Kong SAR China, Taiwan Province of China, or Singapore, migrants must meet a minimum education requirement of junior secondary school. On the other hand, Malaysia and Gulf countries[73] allow migrant domestic workers with only primary school education to be employed. Learning Bahasa Indonesia as a second language can also put children at a disadvantage when sitting for government examinations. For

[68] Vel JA. Uma politics; An ethnography of democratization in West Sumba, Indonesia, 1986-2006. Brill; 2008.
[69] Badan Nasional Penempatan Dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia, 2018. Data Penempatan dan Pelindungan Periode Tahun 2018. Jakarta: Pusat Penelitian Pengembangan dan Informasi (PUSLITFO). Accessed 25 May 2020. Available at http://portal.bnp2tki.go.id/uploads/data/data_12-03-2019_094615_Laporan_Pengolahan_Data_BNP2TKI_2018.pdf.
[70] The terms "overseas employment" and "foreign employment" are used interchangeably.
[71] World Bank, 2017. Indonesia's Global Workers: Juggling Opportunities & Risks, pp. 11–67.
[72] At the time of writing, Indonesia had banned labour migration for individual (household) employment in 19 Middle Eastern countries under Ministerial Decree No. 260, 2015.
[73] The most common Gulf destination for Indonsian migrants is Saudi Arabia, followed by United Arab Emirates and Oman. However, labour migration for Indonesian domestic workers to these countries was banned at the time of writing.

example, children in Homba Karipit village, one of the research sites, only start learning Bahasa Indonesia, the national language, at grade 3 (9 years old).[74] Many children from this village leave school at elementary level.[75]

4.1.2 Recruitment of women migrants promoted as a poverty alleviation strategy

Sumba's labour migration industry, populated by recruitment agents offering services to open doors for aspiring Sumbanese to employment and promising salaries abroad, is well-established and lucrative. Findings from the fieldwork revealed that recruiting a woman for foreign employment can fetch a broker up to IDR 6,500,000 (about USD 460) per recruit, whereas the recruitment of a man for foreign employment can only fetch a broker up to IDR 1,500,000 (about USD 107).[76] This disparity in recruitment fee is attributable to the higher demand for women workers in the domestic work sector in destination countries like Malaysia and Saudi Arabia.


A FGD with youths in West Sumba, East Nusa Tenggara. © Embode 2019

Recruitment agents, often a senior or trusted member of the community, target young prospective migrants for labour migration to meet the demand for women workers in destination countries. Schools are common recruitment sites. Young Sumbanese are bought-in by the prospects of experiencing a more modern lifestyle abroad, as well as the opportunity to improve the economic standing of themselves and their families. They are further lured by the potential of "freedom" from conservative cultures as well as an escape from more serious domestic abuse issues. The economic benefits of labour migration are similarly sold to family members of prospective migrants, revealing how whole families are targets for marketing of foreign employment. Key informants said it is common for recruitment agents to visit family members with offers of cash and gifts in their bid to entice families into allowing their children to migrate for employment. Two parents who were interviewed perceived migration as positive and aspirational because they believed that their children would receive a lucrative salary for relatively short working hours.[77] Parental consent is important not only culturally, but also formally, because written approval from family members and village heads is a pre-migration requirement.[78]

4.1.3 A continuing cycle of migrants

The narrative that migration is both positive and aspirational is rarely challenged or verified by prospective migrants. Returnee migrants who were interviewed said that they sought out friends who had returned from working abroad. They, in turn, introduced them to brokers who made the necessary arrangements for them to migrate. The trust placed on friends who have "successfully" returned to the village, and who may or may not have obtained a commission from the introduction of the potential migrants to brokers, is a significant process in the Sumbanese migration cycle. This reliance on incomplete or potentially biased oral testimony means that the expectations and risks of migration among prospective migrants and their communities are not shaped by credible and formal sources of information. When incomplete and inaccurate information on migration is shared, the sense of personal failure is likely to be amplified by a migrant who has an unsuccessful migration experience relative to these oral testimonies.

When speaking with family members of returnee migrants and community leaders during the fieldwork, it was found that there was generally a positive perception of migration. The communities expressed a favourable impression of migrant workers because they understand that workers migrate with the intention of earning an income to alleviate the family's financial burden. The perception is the same even towards those who return without much money. Family members of returnee migrants who were interviewed also stated that they "would allow" women to migrate again if there is a need for it; this perspective held true even if they were dissatisfied with the migrant's work experiences in cases when the migrant does not send back sufficient remittances to the family, and are aware to some extent of the risks of migration. For example, every villager approached for the research, knew of someone personally who went missing after migrating

[74] As mentioned above, the region has a rich diversity of local languages which are the common mother tongue for children.
[75] Badan Nasional Penempatan Dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia, 2018. Data Penempatan dan Pelindungan Periode Tahun 2018. Jakarta: Pusat Penelitian Pengembangan dan Informasi (PUSLITFO). Accessed 25 May 2020. Available at http://portal.bnp2tki.go.id/uploads/data/data_12-03-2019_094615_Laporan_Pengolahan_Data_BNP2TKI_2018.pdf.
[76] Women often resort to borrowing money from relatives or friends to pay for recruitment. Some also sell their family land in order to bear the cost of recruitment.
[77] Interviews conducted with one woman and one man whose daughters have migrated to Malaysia for employment.
[78] According to Law 18/2017 (Article 13) on the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers, a letter of consent (permission) is required from the next of kin in order to migrate regularly. The next of kin is specifically the parents or legal guardians in the case of single persons, and the spouse in the case of married persons. An acknowledgement is also required by the Head of the Village. The law applies equally to men and women.

to Malaysia. This impression reflects the extensive community buy-in of the narrative that migration is advantageous and should be pursued – a narrative sold by many recruitment agents despite ample evidence to the contrary. Of importance, it also exhibits the level of social expectations placed on those who migrate.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Media and government agencies should seek opportunities to tell more "real" stories of migration through sponsoring TV channels, radio and other outlets to produce films, serials and songs on the subject.

2. Local government and community leaders should seek to open conversations and discussions about the more risky and negative sides of migration to enable more balanced conversations and sharing about what migrants' experience.

4.2 GENDER-BASED SOCIAL NORMS ARE CRITICAL TO UNDERSTANDING MIGRATION CHOICES AND OUTCOMES

> **Yes, I miss my children, but I had to migrate to settle my husband's debts from "pesta adat".**[79]
> – Female returnee migrant worker, West Sumba

Gender-based social norms have a significant influence on migration drivers, choices and outcomes for people in Sumba. The gendered social hierarchy is influenced by traditional norms (locally known as "adat") which provide clear directions about the role of men and women. The overarching division of roles is that men are leaders, of their families, communities as well as of prayer and traditional rituals; women are nurturers and carers, and their place is in the home. Men are identified as the decision-makers, while women are followers and in need of protection. These norms are reinforced through a strong culture of "budaya malu", which may be generally understood as a combined set of social values (and their concomitant social behaviours) around shyness, embarrassment and shame.[80] Such values and culture of what is acceptable and unacceptable influence every aspect of decision-making, choices and opportunities that women face. In alignment with local traditions ("adat") women's standing and community-based regard are measured through the extent to which they fulfil their marriage, reproductive and household responsibilities.[81] These norms also influence the choices and opportunities offered to women, who step beyond these roles, including in migration. This section presents how such social norms influence not only why women migrate, but also how they migrate.

4.2.1 The value of women's work

In Sumba, although women are socially expected to contribute financially to their households, their work is not valued equal to men and does not give them equivalent standing in the household. For example, no matter their financial contributions to the family, they are rarely considered breadwinners or heads of households and have little control over how the family's economic resources are allocated or spent. This secondary standing of women in the family has a significant influence on why and how they migrate.

Undervaluing females and their work, relative to males, starts from birth. As is common in strongly patriarchal cultures, Sumba's social and cultural norms place a higher value on boys than girls. Representatives from the West Sumba District Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection shared that families tend to have up to five children in order to ensure they have a sufficient number of sons. Whilst the representative attributed this to the inadequacy of family planning, it also reveals the gender-based discrimination that girls would face in accessing education, resources and opportunities. In large families, it is usually the responsibility of girls to take care of their younger siblings, thereby pushing them to drop out

[79] *"Pesta adat"* are traditional customary ceremonies, which include weddings and funerals.
[80] Janti N., 2019. Kisah Perempuan Sumba. Available at https://historia.id/kultur/articles/kisah-para-perempuan-sumba-P3qxo.
[81] Sasmita, N., 2018. "Empowering Sumbanese Women through Entrepreneurship." Blog, Hivos - People Unlimited. Accessed July 2018. Available at https://sea.hivos.org/blog/empowering-sumbanese-women-through-entrepreneurship-2/.

of school early. Girls in larger families are also pressured to work outside the home in order to contribute to household income, as well as to marry early in order to alleviate the family's financial standing by gaining a bride price (or "belis" in the local language of East Nusa Tenggara).[82] The representatives of the Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture in Jakarta agreed that patriarchal social structures and unequal power relations between men and women in Sumba mean families prioritize educating their sons over their daughters. Furthermore, educating a girl could even be detrimental to her future prospects for marriage where she would require a higher bride price due to her relatively higher education.

While unequal access to education may put women at a relative disadvantage in terms of power relationships in families and communities, it is not the only determinant of their secondary status. A FBO in Sumba, Jaringan Relawan untuk Kemanusiaan (JRuK), pointed to the fact that those in power in the community (typically men) generally do not have high levels of education. They claim that the men are seen to have a natural physical prowess, which in turn generates a greater social command of authority and power. This social conditioning was well demonstrated by the fact that all four children who were interviewed expressed their respect of their fathers as "heroes" even where the fathers did not contribute financially to the family. Their mothers, who all had a stable job and earned monthly incomes were not given the same regard. This regard may be explained by the traditional roles men take up in the family and community, in accordance with local "adat", as heads of the household, leading prayer and inheriting the family name and assets from his parents.[83] In contrast, women's role as nurturers is not as publicly honoured in the same way.

4.2.2 Expectations of women related to family debt and marriage

As nurturers and supporters in the family, women are also obliged to carry and repay any family debt. According to Yayasan Donders, a FBO based in Sumba[84], women in Sumba are expected, and often compelled, to migrate for work due to debts incurred by their families. Yayasan Donders explained that it is common for Sumbanese families to incur large debts to host traditional customary ceremonies (termed "pesta adat" in Bahasa), including weddings and funerals. There is a strong cultural expectation to spend large amounts of money hosting important cultural ceremonies, which can leave families in significant debt. These expenses include not only the costs of hosting, but also traditional exchanges of money made publicly, such as a bride price ("belis"). A modest wedding ceremony, for example, would require the groom's family to contribute at least 20 buffaloes to the bride's family. Each buffalo costs about USD 250, a sum which takes families months to earn. The larger the bride price, the more esteem the family attracts from the community. However, as expressed by all six district level government agencies, such cultural rituals perpetuate the prevalent idea that women have been "bought" and men now "own" their wives. In turn, women are left to carry the financial burden they have imposed on their husband and feel responsible to help him pay it off. This, in turn, pushes many women to migrate abroad to seek better income. A representative from the South-west Sumba Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection claimed, however, that an ideal "pesta adat" should entail having the extended family members share the financial burden, instead of it being just the responsibility of one person, typically the woman in the household.

A FGD with children left behind in West Sumba, East Nusa Tenggara © Embode 2019

Gendered norms also influence child labour and unsafe migration. Child labour is common in Sumba, with an estimated ratio of three children working to every ten adults.[85] It is reported that children, between 12 and 15 years of age, often need to work to contribute to family income. The West Sumba District Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection reported, *"Children are requested by their parents to work to alleviate the financial burden of the family. As they are often junior or high school graduates, they feel shame in working as peasants in their village. For these reasons, they prefer to find work as shopkeepers or domestic workers in other cities and towns".*[86] This also shields them from being identified as

[82] A "bride price" is money, property, or other form of wealth paid by a groom or his family to the family of the woman he is marrying.
[83] Nurdiah, E.A., Altrerosje, A.S.R.I. and Hariyanto, A.D., 2015. Gendered Space in West Sumba Traditional Houses. DIMENSI (Journal of Architecture and Built Environment), 42(2), pp. 69–76.
[84] The FBO Yayasan Donders provides shelter for trafficked and abused women and children.
[85] Interview with a representative from the West Sumba District Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection.
[86] Ibid.

child labour cases and saves their family from any shame.[87] In such cases, it is also understood that girls in particular seek work away from home, not only to earn an income, but also to escape unwanted or forced marriage, especially ones that involve kidnapping (termed "kawin tangkap").[88] There have been seven reported cases of "bride kidnapping" cases in Sumba between December 2016 to June 2020, with many more believed to go unreported.[89]

4.2.3 Systemic disempowerment of women

In Sumba, women are actively conditioned and encouraged to put the needs of others first, and to be passive, obedient followers of their husbands and other male members of their community. One NGO SBMI commented, *"Gender discrimination has been institutionalised by family, culture, and religion and causes women to lack self-confidence. This also causes women migrant workers to not think of themselves as the breadwinner in their family. They think that they only assist their husband".*[90] Family members of migrants stated that women are more inclined to send money home and to ensure that "tummies are filled", in contrast to male migrants who regularly put their own needs first when deciding how to spend their foreign employment earnings. Furthermore, despite contributing to family income, decisions about how this money is spent is the prerogative of the "head of the household". According to key informants, men feel entitled to the income earned by women in the family and believe that women should re-migrate to sustain family incomes despite the personal risks to their safety and well-being. According to Yayasan Donders, money which migrants save over two years of employment can be used up in as short a period as three months of the migrants' return home. This money is usually spent on traditional festivals ("pesta adat").

4.2.4 Women's place is limited to the domestic sphere

> **"Budaya malu" is related to the ideal picture that a female should be at home.** – *Village Head*

> **According to "adat", a female is supposed to be at home.**
> – *Representative from a local FBO*

Local tradition and norms strongly place a women's role in the home. Consequently, in order to migrate abroad for work, women in Sumba must navigate formal and informal paternalistic power structures and bureaucratic processes that have the effect of removing or shrinking women migrants' agency. One of the ways in which this occurs is through the requirement for any migrant to prove their spouse has consented to their migration.[91] Given that a much higher proportion of women migrate compared to men[92], there is little evidence about how women provide permission to their husbands to migrate, and which conditions, if any, they put on them. However, the reported tendency of husbands to articulate conditions on their approval letters to support the migration of their wives may be explained by the local traditional norms. As one NGO representative stated, *"When men migrate, women are expected to sign the permission letter without questioning their husbands. When women migrate, the men sign permission letters with conditions attached to it, such as requiring the women to send monthly remittances to the men while abroad."*

Following the transfer for a bride price ("belis"), women are conditioned to be obliged to her husband for the sum. A significant part of this obligation is contributing to the husband's carrying out of traditional ceremonies ("pesta adat").[93] This was confirmed by a representative of the Coordinating Ministry of Human Development and Culture, who stated, *"Culturally, once the woman has already received the 'belis', then she is obliged to take orders willingly."* One Jakarta based NGO commented that *"the situation in Sumba is in contrast to the situation in other parts of Indonesia, such as in Java where wives ask the husbands for divorces if the men migrate overseas and no longer remit money home."*

---

[87] The local concept of "shame" known as "budaya malu" is further explained in the next section.

[88] "Kawin tangkap" or bride kidnapping is a tradition where single girls or women are captured and wed by men interested in them. There is no age limit for this. If a girl has attained puberty, she is considered an adult and there is no restriction for kidnapping her. The practice of bride kidnapping is sometimes prearranged by families due to insufficient monetary resources of the groom to pay a bride price. In other occasions, however, the girls or women are caught by surprise and are not able to resist or escape the kidnappings. This can be a traumatic experience for the girls or women and their families.

[89] Kompas.com, 2020, Kawin tangkap di Sumba, Diculik untuk Dinikahi, Citra Menagis sampai Tenggorokan Kering, Kompas.com. 7 September 2020. Accessed 26 July 2020. Available at https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/07/09/06070001/kawin-tangkap-di-sumba-diculik-untuk-dinikahi-citra-menangis-sampai?page=all#page2.

[90] Interview with a representative of the national NGO, Serikat Buruh Migran Indonesian (SBMI).

[91] According to Law 18/2017 (Article 13) on the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers, a letter of consent (permission) is required from the next of kin in order to migrate regularly. The next of kin is specifically the parents or legal guardians in the case of single persons, and the spouse in the case of married persons. An acknowledgement is also required by the Head of the Village. The law applies equally to men and women.

[92] As expressed in interviews with District Offices of Manpower, Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, as well as Social Affairs, across both regions.

[93] Anisa, D.F., 2019. Menyingkap Peran Perempuan dan Tradisi Budaya Sumba. Berita Satu. Available at www.beritasatu.com/elvira-anna-siahaan/hiburan/553884/menyingkap-peran-perempuan-dan-tradisi-budaya-sumba.
Kleden, D., 2017. Belis dan Harga Seorang Perempuan Sumba (Perkawinan Adat Suku Wewewa, Sumba Barat Daya, NTT). Jurnal Studi Budaya Nusantara. Available at https://jsbn.ub.ac.id/index.php/sbn/article/view/.

Families often spoke of granting permission for migration through the prism of exerting control over a woman's migration choices. For example, family members agreed that they "would allow" the women to re-migrate if they so desire because the family needs the money for sustenance. Similarly, returnees who were interviewed said that their spouses "did not allow" them to re-migrate because they did not want them to leave their children. In some cases, control over women's migration choices is exercised through the State institutions. Key informants expressed that there have been incidents where husbands contacted BP2MI and requested that the agency bring their wives home because they are not remitting money. BP2MI has brought the women home in a number of cases, with their consent. There have been instances where the women deliberately choose to exercise their right of not sending any money home.

It is relevant to note that three returnee women migrants who were interviewed reported that they had left their village without informing their husbands or family members. They stated that this was a way of circumventing requirements around obtaining permission to travel as they did not expect their husbands to let them go. They admitted that their families were angry that they had left without their consent, yet the women expressed how they felt obliged to migrate for work in order to earn remittances. Leaving home without consent contravenes local norms and may have consequences for women once they return, as expressed by the South-west Sumba District Office of Social Affairs: *"According to local 'adat', in the case of a person leaving without consent of their parents/family members, then they will face problem with 'adat.'"*

4.2.5 Community efforts to respond to traditional gendered norms

FBO Yayasan Pengembangan Kemanusiaan Donders mandela promoting women's rights and empowerment. © Embode 2019

Although some central government initiatives seek to redress the imbalanced impact of gendered norms, these are yet to reach Sumba. For example, the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection is implementing a programme which delivers training on financial and remittance management to returnee migrant workers and their family members.[94] As of December 2019, the training had been delivered to 117 migrant groups that have been established in 13 provinces, 65 districts/city, 95 sub-districts, and 104 villages.[95] Although the training is delivered through the District Offices of Manpower and Social Affairs at local levels, this had not yet reached Sumba at the time of this research. It is proposed that such training would be integral to not only ensuring the sustainable management of remittances and prevent any further unsafe migration, but also to target the gendered dynamics around this decision-making within families.

Furthermore, the BP2MI (Agency for the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers) has formulated a pre-departure orientation programme under which safe migration is promoted in line with gender mainstreaming. The module covers various topics such as understanding gender, gender discrimination, understanding employment contracts, and understanding the law and culture of the destination country. This programme is yet to be contextualized and delivered in Sumba.

At local levels, no programmes responding to gender inequalities were identified apart from the local Church. Recognizing the level of patriarchy in Sumba, one priest in Kodi[96] shared how women lacked opportunity to express themselves in the public sphere, despite their significant role and influence on the family and community. Although the Church representatives[97] expressed their active approach in expanding this space, along with engaging in other community-focused activities[98], it was unclear what this was and how this empowered women.

[94] This is the Bina Keluarga Pekerja Migran Indonesia/BKPMI programme, implemented under Ministry Regulation 20/2010.
[95] Kementerian Pemberdayan Perempuan Dan Perlingdungan Anak Republik Indonesia, 2020. "Angka Pekerja Migran Indonesia di Lombok Tenggah Tinggi, Kemen PPPA Perkuat Pembinaan Keluarga." Published on 21 February 2020. Available at https://kemenpppa.go.id/index.php/page/read/29/2589/angka-pekerja-migran-indonesia-di-lombok-tengah-tinggi-kemen-pppa-perkuat-pembinaan-keluarga. https://jdih.kemenpppa.go.id/peraturan/Permeneg%20PP&PA%20No.20%20Thn%202010%20-%20Pedum%20Bina%20Keluarga%20TKI.pdf.
[96] Interview with a priest in Kodi.
[97] Three priests were interviewed.
[98] The Church engages in improving access to education and awareness-raising of safe migration, among its community-focused activities.

4.2.6 Labour intermediaries are heroes and warriors

Recruiters and brokers are generally well regarded in the community and relied upon by aspiring migrants. They tend to be men of relatively high economic standing within the community and known personally to families of migrants. Perhaps due to this reason, efforts by the West Sumba District Office of Manpower to phase out and replace informal labour migration intermediaries with formally appointed migration coordinators have not been effective.[99]

The unchallenged narrative of migration as positive and aspirational is reflected in the community perception of those who offer pathways to migrating abroad. According to returnee migrants who were interviewed, many communities in Sumba view labour recruiters and brokers as "heroes" and "warriors" who are assisting with poverty alleviation by providing job opportunities for villagers. This esteem for brokers – licensed and unlicensed – is attributed to their ability to navigate intimidating bureaucratic procedures for migration within a short time. The ability of brokers and recruiters to surpass bureaucratic hurdles in the migration process is perceived as proof of their immense competency; this perception reinforces prospective migrants' corresponding reliance on such services, which underscores the wider gaps in accessibility and systemic governance in the formal processes that facilitate outward migration.

In this position of influence, the recruitment agents and brokers in Sumba play a paternalistic, but often disempowering role for potential migrants. They set the tone for the workers' employment experience by providing potential migrants with information on job scope and remuneration terms, providing documentation necessary for travel and telling their clients how to behave once they arrive in countries of destination. Of note, the dynamic is influenced by a gendered element, given that most brokers are men, and the migrant workers are women. All seven women returnees interviewed had varying versions of "recruiter's advice" that emphasized the submissive position of the migrant worker vis-à-vis those who employ them in the country of destination. Interviewees expressed how they were told not to speak up against their employers and to work hard, long hours and not be of any trouble to their employers; advice which potential migrants take seriously. Such advice strengthens the cultural conditioning of female migrants to put the needs of others first and not to question the voice of male authority, which, in turn, further normalizes exploitative and abusive practices perpetrated by employers in destination countries.

CASE STUDY 1

My name is YL and I am in my thirties. I come from West Sumba District. I worked in Malaysia for two years. I asked my husband for permission to work in Malaysia and he approved. Not long after telling a friend of mine of my intention to work abroad, a middleman came to my house. He told me that I would be paid RM400 (~USD 100) per month and that I would have a four-month salary deduction for recruitment fees. I was alright with it as I come from a poor family and did not have large sums of money saved up which I could use for recruitment fees.

I obtained my passport three months later and made the move to Malaysia. My job in Malaysia was very difficult. I worked for an employer in a shop in Kuala Lumpur. After working long hours at the shop, I would go back to the employer's house where I lived and be responsible for domestic chores. I also had to take care of the employer's children. I woke up at 7am daily and started working at the employer's shop from 8am till 10pm. I would then go back home and continue working at home. During my first week, I accidentally damaged something in the shop. For that, I was locked up by my female employer for an hour. My male employer came back and released me. I did not know how long I would be locked up if the male employer did not arrive. I did not want to report my long hours and abuse in Malaysia to my agent because I did not want to cause any problem. The agent was very clear with his advice to me before I left Indonesia, *"Listen to your employer. Do not be smart. And do not cause any trouble. Agree with everything your employer says."* I deserved the punishment I received from my employer.

[99] District Office of Manpower representatives claimed the informal labour intermediaries had been phased out since 2019, however this was contradicted by data gleaned in interviews with migrants and their families.

4.2.7 Submissive behaviour as a strategy for positive migration experiences

Submissive behaviour is not a guarantee for positive migration experiences at destination countries. All seven returnees interviewed experienced labour rights violations and exploitation while abroad, but none recognized themselves as having been exploited. They were not able to contact their families regularly[100], paid less than they were promised by recruitment agents, experienced unlawful salary deductions and some endured difficult and unlawful working conditions. This is partly attributable to a lack of credible information on safe migration; most migrants from Sumba sought information on migration through personal networks and relied on recruitment agents whose advice was mainly to "listen to your employer and do your work properly".

The implication of such advice is that the responsibility of ensuring "successful" migration falls squarely on the shoulders of the individual migrant; migration would only fail if a migrant "causes trouble" or is not meeting the expectations of an employer. Such advice also helps to normalize exploitative practices. When exploitation is normalized by male authoritative figures, women migrants internalize the acceptance of such practices and dissociate themselves from their rights as workers and human beings.

4.2.8 Gendered impact of barriers to safe migration

The paternalism that pervades the start of the migration cycle is best exemplified by the requirement for prospective migrants to obtain written permission to travel from village heads and family members. Although the requirement applies equally to men and women, the impact of this requirement on the pattern of feminized labour migration from Sumba has gender-differentiated implications. According to key informants, letters from village heads are provided to potential migrant workers only after the worker has been issued with an ID card and obtained the permission required either from their spouse or from their parents for those who are unmarried. Upon obtaining the letter, the prospective migrants make their way to Kupang, the capital city of East Nusa Tenggara for medical testing and once they pass the medical test, they make their way to the destination countries.

Although such requirements have been put in place to help protect migrants and regulate foreign employment, the relative administrative and political challenge in meeting them have the actual impact of forming a barrier to safe migration. Navigating such administrative paperwork, as well as patriarchal structures can often push women into using irregular migration channels. Of the seven returnee women migrants interviewed, five reported migrating through irregular channels. In such cases, women bear high personal risks to make labour migration possible, which in turn makes them more vulnerable to exploitative practices at destination. When asked why people choose to migrate through irregular means, JRuK, a Sumba-based FBO said, *"The village heads are usually very hard to meet. How are villagers supposed to get the approval letter to migrate in a short span of time? It is sometimes difficult even for us to meet with some village heads."*

The requirement for an approval letter from the village head is only for international migration; however, there is no way to ascertain that villagers who claim to only migrate internally (without needing the approval letter from the village head) remain in Indonesia. A village head interviewed stated that many may claim to migrate internally but end up moving abroad irregularly. It was also found that some women were able to migrate abroad for employment by processing through a neighbouring village by the recruitment agent, instead of in their own village.

4.2.9 Paternalistic views that deem women as too weak to migrate

The requirement for a formal approval from village heads for migration institutionalizes the gender-based power imbalances that this report has highlighted above. As mentioned, the requirement shifts the decision-making power of a woman migrant on her migration choices to patriarchal figures at the very beginning of the migration cycle. Although the practice of obtaining approval letters is necessary for both the potential male and female migrant worker, the regulation has differing implications for both male and female migrants. The potential male migrant sees the practice of acquiring a letter from his wife as a procedure within the larger migration system. For women, seeking this approval relies entirely on the willingness of her husband and the village head to allow her to migrate based on their perception of her strength and ability coupled with the financial need of the household. Such willingness to support a woman's migration from a woman's husband and community can be a challenge where prevailing narratives of the women's relative "weakness" are

[100] All seven returnees said they were only allowed to contact families after a year in Malaysia.

extrapolated to her capacity to migrate. One village head opined that *"women are at higher risk than men when migrating because women are weak mentally and physically, and therefore more vulnerable to being abused by their employers".*

During interviews with nine family members or relatives of the returnees, all adult family members felt that it was riskier for women to migrate because they are easily influenced by people and may not possess as much mental and physical strength as men. As one member stated, *"The risk of migration is more for women than men, because they are 'women'".* They believed that men are able to fight back, and both female and male interviewees agreed that this was the reason why migration is riskier for women. The perception that migration is riskier for women was also conveyed among five adult family members of migrants working abroad who were interviewed. Of note, all of them believed that their family member who made a decision to migrate would not return home, either because they were dead, or were lost – either physically and mentally from violence experienced abroad.

RECOMMENDATIONS

3. Local government agencies should collaborate and support faith-based organizations to conduct awareness-raising at the community level, focusing on providing basic information on abuse, exploitation and violence in its myriad of forms so that the community is able to identify, prevent and respond to abusive and exploitative situations.

4. The Ministry of Manpower, the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, and the Ministry of Social Affairs should collaborate and provide technical assistance to the provincial and district level counterparts in designing anti-trafficking programmes using the 3P (Prevention, Protection and Prosecution) approach while mainstreaming gender sensitivity and addressing social norms in their programmes.

5. Local government agencies should promote the leadership of women in formal spaces, such as local government departments and agencies, and in village community leadership positions.

6. The BP2MI (Agency for the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers) should extend, adapt and deliver their pre-departure orientation programme to the Sumba region to promote gender mainstreaming and support the empowerment of women migrant workers.

7. All counterparts should further investigate the push factors for increasing migration of women and specifically look at the factors that contribute to the high number of irregular migrations.

8. Central and local government agencies to review the requirements acquiring permissions and authorizations from heads of villages and next of kin through a gender lens, so that they do not unfairly burden women more than men.

9. The Ministry of Manpower to conduct financial empowerment training and awareness-raising programmes for potential migrants, returnees, and their family members. These programmes should focus on effective financial and resource management strategies, such as investing in activities which can generate financial returns, as well as encourage more gender equitable decision-making processes in the family.

10. Local government agencies to follow up the effective implementation and enforcement of MoUs between them and religious and cultural leaders to eliminate practices that place women and children in dangerous positions because of "adat".

4.3 WEAKNESSES IN GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES LIMIT THE RESPONSES TO SUPPORT MIGRANTS

> **Government agencies are not speaking to each other. There is a lack of coordination between central and provincial government agencies.**
> *– Female district level government official*

Whereas the consideration of social norms and stigma on enablers on trafficking and service provisions relate to the attitudes and cultures of communities, the influence of governance structures is also relevant to explore. Responses to trafficking, as mandated by local and national frameworks, are stretched relative to the demand and need of migrants wishing to work abroad. These lead to governance gaps and may well be incentivizing irregular migration practices which circumvent regulatory safeguards put in place to protect migrant workers. This was reflected in the research findings through a stark contrast between interviews with government officials who spoke of the various frameworks and processes developed to safeguard migrants, and the testimonies of migrant workers and their families that irregular means were used in their foreign employment. This section sets out some of the key ways in which these gaps influenced the experiences of migrants in seeking work and returning. It also provides the foundation for Section 4.4 which focuses on how social norms and stigma impact the responsiveness of service provisions.

4.3.1 The lack of formal identity documents is prevalent

One of the key barriers to regular migration in Sumba is the administrative challenges in securing formal identification documents. This is primarily compounded by the low rate of birth registration in Sumba. The reasons for the low level of registered births are partly due to the lack of awareness of the Sumbanese of its importance, as well as the lack of capacity of governance structures to facilitate birth registration processes. One local journalist stated, "*Only 500 blank IDs are issued by the central government on a monthly basis for this area*[101]*, a number that is deemed by local agencies as too small. When the quota is used up, obtaining an ID is cumbersome, as the local population and civil registration office representatives would have to make the trip to Jakarta personally for collection purposes".* Other barriers to registration of birth or of identification documents include requirements around the issuing of marriage certificates of parents,[102] as well as the long distance from the nearest Population and Civil Registration Office.[103] Whereas many of these bureaucratic hurdles may be overcome, they can be expensive and challenging to navigate for communities with a prevalence of low education and for whom such registrations are not a priority.

Navigating or circumventing "bureaucratic barriers" is the essence of the recruitment agent's service. For example, representatives from the West Sumba Manpower District Office suggest that villagers ought to avail themselves of the government's migration "one stop centres"[104] for all their migration needs instead of going through unregistered brokers or recruitment agents. However, the nearest one-stop centre in NTT is located in Kupang, which is a 28-hour ferry ride away, rendering such service practically inaccessible. Furthermore, the Manpower District Offices of both West Sumba and South-west Sumba are limited by financial and human resource capacities. Whereas they do focus on verifying identification documents and job offers as well as engage in safe migration awareness-raising campaigns, they are not able to offer the full range of services needed and are also not able to cover the full geographic area of their mandates. These gaps leave both prospective and returning migrants with few avenues for authentication of documents and any related protections.

4.3.2 How a lack of formal identity enables unsafe migration and trafficking outcomes

Within this context, it is clear to see how a lack of registration is experienced as a complicated layer of bureaucracy that necessitates navigation and circumvention on the part of the prospective migrant. In all seven testimonies of returnee migrant workers, the women were taken to neighbouring villages where their Indonesian ID cards were issued under the

[101] The limited quota of 500 blank ID Cards per-month applied to all districts and was related to the changing process of the ID Card system to the new electronic ID Card/e-ID Card system (or in Bahasa: e-KTP) nationally and simultaneously.
[102] Birth certificates are issued to children, including in cases where only the mother is identified as the parent. According to Presidential Regulation No 25/2008 concerning Requirements and Procedures on Population Registration and Civil Registration, article 52 (2), a birth registration is required even in the absence of a marriage certificate between the child's parents. In application, this article means that despite the child being born to a single mother, the child should be entitled to a birth certificate, irrespective of whether the child was born to a single mother or not. However, many officers and community members are not aware of this regulation.
[103] The Population and Civil Registration Office is the local government department whose function it is to issue birth certificates.
[104] One-stop centres (LTSA) provide services for health checks, document applications, document checks and social protection coverage.

name and identity of another person (presumably someone in that village), so that the head of the village was able to sign all the required authorizations for the prospective migrant. The alternative would have meant higher costs to acquire legitimate documents as well as months of delay to the migrant's journey.

A core part of social identity is a person's sense of belonging to their community. Living and growing up within a community can enable people to become highly socialized to a sense of identity to the extent that it may never be questioned. This sense of belonging and personal identification with a community also enables access to services and structures of social protection that are provided to community members. However, on migrating away from their communities, people may become disconnected from this sense of identity, as it becomes partially shaped by formal processes, such as identity documents bearing a person's name, age and other identifiers. Where these documents are falsified in order to enable irregular migration, people may face a barrier in accessing social protection. The consequences which stem from an absence of formal and genuine identification with their communities may, in turn, negatively impact the migrants' safe return to, and reintegration into their community. The research found that all seven returnee migrant workers had no genuine ID card before migration and all their required ID documents were falsified.

Although falsified identity documents enable the opening of pathways for migration and improved economic outcomes, it can also lead to unsafe migration outcomes. For example, underage girls[105] without birth certificates can obtain falsified documents that show she is older than she is and therefore qualified to migrate for work. Apart from the detrimental effects of child labour, the false identity has the effect of stripping a migrant of her genuine identity, denying her the rights of a child, disconnecting her ties to the community and preventing her access to the social protection right from the outset of her migration cycle. The inherent risks of this were demonstrated by the fact that every villager interviewed knew of someone personally who went missing after migrating to Malaysia for employment. Without an identity and its societal links, a migrant becomes another nondescript body. If family members do not hear from the migrant while abroad, their ability to trace the migrant is also curtailed with the falsification of names and other identifiers in fake identity cards or documents. The falsification of identity documents is also problematic when repatriating a worker home, especially if she does not remember the location of her hometown due to trauma experienced while abroad.

4.3.3 Limited interventions for returnee migrants in Sumba

The services and interventions available for returnee migrants, including those experiencing trafficking and exploitation, are limited and ad hoc. The main reasons for these are the significant lack of financial and human resource capacity of local government entities mandated to protect migrant workers. The lack of such formal protections, services and responses, means that there is a higher reliance on informal structures of community and family in dealing with any challenging migration events and experiences. This, in turn, can leave victims of trafficking and other returnee migrants to deal with social and community dynamics without professional help.

The lack of governance capacity is perhaps most reflective in the fact that local anti-trafficking task forces (ATTF) are either not yet established or not prioritized in West Sumba and South-west Sumba districts.[106] This leaves Manpower District Offices with the insurmountable task of tracking and registering returnees, many of whom will have initially migrated through irregular means, including through the use of falsified identity documents. Without sufficient understanding of who is returning and about their needs and experiences, other offices, such as the District Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, have little data to inform the development and targeting of reintegration assistance.

The most that a returnee might receive in terms of support is transportation home, which may either be availed through a government structure, or through the coordination of the recruitment agent himself.[107] In such cases, urgent medical care may also be sought where deemed necessary and obvious by the receiving official or agent. Further to that, all other support is left to the family and community of the returnee migrant. In cases where returnees have been trafficked or abused, communities are left to cope with traditional and social mores, such as traditional healing, relationships and their expectations. Of note, even where any opportunity for formal services may be offered, victims are reticent to avail themselves of such. Not only may they not regard themselves as victims, but also, they may generally have a lack of trust for authorities.

[105] According to the Law 18/2017 and its derivative regulation (Ministerial Decree 9/2019), one of the requirements to work overseas is that the prospective migrant worker (both male and female) has to be at least 18 years old as the minimum age.
[106] Information shared by IOM Indonesia.
[107] One recruitment agent who was interviewed stated that where he received reports of a migrant in distress in the destination, he would facilitate her safe return.

4.3.4 Capacity constraints of government departments responding to trafficking in persons

> **The way trafficking cases are handled is not good enough. We react and respond instead of working on prevention. Our programmes have no clear targets.** – *Representative of the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, Indonesia*

It is important to note the specific ways in which efforts of local departments in providing services to prospective and returnee migrants, including victims of trafficking are hampered.

There are several government efforts that have been initiated for the protection of women and children and the prevention of trafficking. The establishment of a Desmigratif (Village of Productive Migrants) programme by the Ministry of Manpower in Indonesia, for example, aims to address issues at different stages of the migration process and outlines activities for different populations affected by migration, including potential migrants, returnee migrants, families and migrant workers. In South-west Sumba, there are two Local Regulations (PERDA): PERDA No.9/2016 on trafficking in persons and PERDA No.3/2019 on Protection for Women and Children. Both are participative local regulations which means that all relevant stakeholders were involved in the drafting of the PERDA. The implementation of these local regulations, however, is still a challenge. Throughout the research, government stakeholders who were interviewed spoke repeatedly about capacity constraints of their own department, the lack of coordination between different agencies working on this issue and the overall inability to support victims of trafficking once they return from a destination country. It is noted, that whereas the issue of financial and human resources capacity is fundamental, there are some particular strategic responses that could be improved in the medium term.

One key area identified is the lack of disaggregated data on trafficking and migration at local and national levels. Where statistics on trafficking and migration exist, the data differs between various government agencies. The lack of data and its inconsistencies contribute to a mismatch in planning priorities between national and provincial governments. Certain databases, such as police data, only includes reported cases of trafficking, while other databases may only include those migrants which are appropriately registered. This results in significant gaps between datasets across which none are broken down by sex, age or other useful identifiers to allow for comparison and cross referencing. Consequently, a lack of institutional capacity to draw a complete picture of the issues leads to an incapacity to formulate and budget for strategic, evidence-based responses.

Another key area where improvement could be more immediately ameliorated is in coordinating responses among the principal mandated entities in regulating migration and responding to related issues, including trafficking. The Ministries and local departments of (i) Manpower, (ii) Social Affairs, and (iii) Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, could better coordinate their efforts through the establishment of a local anti-trafficking task force. Current efforts, such as campaigns being run by the West Sumba District Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection at gender mainstreaming among Village Heads, could be supported and strengthened through the District Offices of Manpower and Social Affairs. Meanwhile, the need for in-house mental health professionals and social workers to provide services to victims of trafficking, could be solved by joining the resources of both the West Sumba District Offices of Manpower and Social Affairs. This coordination is likely to be effective, as both offices identified this need when they were interviewed separately.

The impact of such institutional capacity constraints is compounded by the general lack of understanding of trafficking in persons as a crime. For example, it was common for government stakeholders, both in districts as well as at the central level, to express an understanding that trafficking was only a cross-border crime and not an internal migration issue. Furthermore, government officials interviewed in both Sumba and Jakarta believed that those who migrated regularly could never become victims of trafficking. Such a lack of understanding about how people fall victim to trafficking further undermines efforts to prevent and respond to these serious issues.

RECOMMENDATIONS

11. Local government district offices should establish or re-establish local ATTFs in order to improve the coordination of improved identification, referral and reintegration processes of victims of trafficking.

12. Local governments, through the established ATTF, to work with IOM to enhance data gathering and analysis on trafficking, migration and reintegration processes.

13. National ATTF and relevant local governments (through local ATTFs) should develop a local action plan on trafficking, which includes interventions for returnee migrant workers.

14. Central government should improve access to marriage and birth registration, as well as identification cards, at the grassroots level through coordination with existing local public and non-governmental organizations. This should also include increasing the quota of ID provisions.

15. National ATTF to establish a multi-sectoral MoU that standardizes data on migration and trafficking at national and district levels, and establishes a data-sharing mechanism.

4.4 SOCIAL STIGMATIZATION IMPACTS RETURNEE MIGRANTS' EXPERIENCES AND THEIR DISCONNECT FROM SUPPORT SERVICES

> **I admit. There is a tendency of negative perception among law enforcement officials towards (unsuccessful) migrants.**
> *– Female government official based in Jakarta*

In the sections above, this report discussed how social norms and migration governance structures and frameworks converge to shape migration choices and decisions, especially for women in Sumba. In this section, the report will examine how these social norms and power structures impact the many ways returnee migrants perceive their own migration experiences, their assistance-seeking behaviour and approaches to reintegration once they return to their own communities.

4.4.1 The meaning of "successful migration" is relative

Fundamental to the way returnees are received after their migration experience is the way their migration is perceived by their family and community, especially as to whether it was a successful or an unsuccessful migration. In Sumba, a "successful migration" was found to be understood and perceived as relative to other factors, rather than in absolute terms.

On the one hand, success was found to be characterized by ostentatious displays of wealth by returnee migrants, usually linked to the performance of cultural rituals among village communities. At least three of the women who returned home after migration expressed feeling more confident in themselves and taking more decision-making authority in the home and family, as well as the extended family. One woman expressed, *"I was very thin, and my bones were exposed, but now I am better. With the money I got from Malaysia, I have been able to renovate my house, even though it is still ugly. I have also been able to start selling snacks and other items."* Returnee women also felt good about being able to contribute to traditional rituals, which in turn provided more standing given the fulfilment of their traditional role. On the other hand, an "unsuccessful" migration involving distressing experiences abroad were not spoken about by the returnee. In turn, those who did share their negative experiences with family members found that their families did not speak about these with others in order to prevent "embarrassment" ("budaya malu") in the community. It was noted that during interviews with families of returnee migrants, the most frustration expressed with regard to "unsuccessful migration" was most felt in the insufficient financial resources to perform cultural rituals. The view that failed migration is a collective family responsibility can explain why an individual migrant may feel a great burden to be successful as they know that failure may reflect badly on their family.

Despite such perspectives on what is a successful and unsuccessful migration, it was of fundamental relevance to find that the community had the utmost concern for those who did not return at all. As mentioned, all community members interviewed knew of at least one person who had migrated and not returned, nor had kept in contact with the family. Given such considerations, a representative from Yayasan Donders remarked that, *"As long as the person does not return in a coffin, the community is overjoyed with the person's return".* The representative went on to demonstrate this by sharing the case of a woman who had arrived at the airport in a very bad physical condition. It was clear that she had been a victim of physical abuse at the hands of her employers in Malaysia. A large gathering of people had arrived to receive and celebrate her. Such celebrations are even more joyous for those who return home without problems and with all their promised salaries. Such perspectives were also confirmed by the Districts Offices of Manpower in both West and South-west Sumba who expressed, *"The family is grateful when the migrant worker finally returns home even where they may be sick or mentally ill."*

4.4.2 Normalization of violence in migration experience

Social norms that identify women as weak, subversive and in need of protection, and the expectation for them to have "successful migration" shape the way migrants perceive their experiences abroad and how they respond to those experiences once they return to Sumba. The returnees interviewed during this research showed that migrants, especially women migrants, often normalize the violence and poor labour practices they experienced while abroad. While the research did not specifically look into issues of abuse and violence in the community and other institutional spheres, it found that violence was often downplayed when it occurs in the context of labour migration due to the social conditioning and expectations for women.

All seven returnees who were interviewed experienced multiple labour rights violations and endured difficult working conditions, but did not view or identify themselves as being subject to exploitation. In one example, a returnee migrant who worked as a domestic worker in the employer's home and shop spoke of being locked in a room for almost an hour by her female employer because of an accident in her first week of employment. The male employer let her out upon coming to see that she had been locked in the room. If he had not, the worker said she did not know how long her female employer would have kept her locked up. In spite of such extreme treatment, the worker believed the "punishment" was reflective of the gravity of her mistake.

When returnees called home and spoke about the difficulties they faced abroad, they spoke of their family members asking them to be patient and pray. This messaging is consistent with pre-migration advice by recruitment agents to women to *"listen to your employer and do your work properly",* reflecting the expectations of how women should behave in the face of hardship and passivity. It reaffirms the returnees' initial belief that exploitative working conditions are to be expected, and that those who cannot withstand the pressure of such conditions will not be rewarded or succeed in her migration.

Conditioning women to accept violence and exploitative labour practices as normal have an impact on migrants' assistance-seeking behaviour. When the experiences of these women were shared, the researchers informed them that this is a violation of their fundamental rights. On hearing this, interviewees were visibly unhappy about the exploitation they faced. When asked what they would do about it, they said that they could speak to their brokers or agents about it. There seemed to be a heavy reliance on the agent machinery for resolution, perhaps because it is the closest, most accessible and familiar structure to these women. None of the women seemed to think that any other agency – government or otherwise – could be of assistance to them.

There was noticeable reticence among returnee migrants with respect to seeking redress or assistance for the rights violations they experienced after returning to Sumba. Some of them sought assistance from their agent during their time abroad. For these women, they felt that their real need occurred when they were in their difficult working environment rather than once they had already returned home. One of the women stated, *"It is too late now to report my case to the agent. I am also afraid."* Another expressed, *"The lady was big. I lost a lot of weight when I came back from Malaysia because of my experience. The work was too tough. I called the agent three times before I quit my job. The agent made a call and yelled at my employer".* Other women also expressed how they had called or intended to call their agents, after finding they were not paid as promised or encountered other unfair working conditions, but to no avail. On being asked whether they would seek redress now that they had returned, some said that they were too "lazy" to even ask the agents for assistance. When asked further about this, the women expressed a level of hopelessness about the help they would realistically be able to obtain now. Navigating government agencies can feel daunting and requires a level of confidence that the women did not feel they had.

4.4.3 Stigmatization of returnee migrants

> **Many children who are abused are from families whose mothers are abroad or in a different province for work.**
> *– Female representative at the West Sumba District Office of WECP*

Gender significantly influences how returnee migrants and any perceived failure of their migration are received by their communities. Migrating for work challenges social and familial expectations of gender-based division of labour and women as nurturers of children. Whereas women seeking to migrate perceive themselves as agents of economic change for their families, others may see them as neglecting their nurturing domestic role and responsible for the breakdown of their family as well as their potential abuse.

Of note, many of those expressing stigmatized views of women migrants were government officials. For example, one representative from the District Office of Social Affairs in South-west Sumba said women choose to migrate because there is competition among them to "look nice" and looking nice requires them having more money. Other personnel from the office explained how he questions unsuccessful returnees on "what they did wrong" in the country of destination, raising concerns about victim-blaming.

The representatives of the Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture in Jakarta were able to explain matters from a different perspective. They shared how women are often encouraged to migrate due to the patriarchal view that they were there to serve the men. Furthermore, women who migrate must prepare themselves for the possibility that their husbands would leave them and their children would not be taken care of. Women migrant's exercise of agency by choosing to migrate is sometimes deemed as being responsible for the disintegration of the family unit and therefore worthy of punishment. Of particular concern was the assertion by representatives from the West Sumba District Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection that child sexual abuse was an impact of women's migration: *"Many children who are abused are from families whose mothers are abroad or at a different province for work."* The perpetrators of abuse, typically sexual abuse, are usually the villagers themselves. Such notions have been used in attempts to restrict the mobility of women by arguing that their migration leads to family breakdown, divorce and abuse of their children.

Other negative implications on women returning without adequate financial resources to show for their time away is the attribution of such "failure" on their character and a consequence of their resistance to paternalistic power structures. For example, one village head blamed the perceived failure of migrants on their "bad attitudes" and for leaving the village without his formal permission. He added that migration is good when people do it "sincerely", that is when people come home with a lump sum of money, unlike those who come home "empty-handed". Such attitudes not only perpetuate victim-blaming but also reflects a discrimination against women who exercise their own choice and freedom. Migrants' experiences – whether enduring exploitative behaviour during the migration cycle, returning home empty-handed or with very little remuneration from not being paid the promised wages by the employer,[108] or remitting money regularly to family members who have spent it – were discounted when they did not return with a lump sum of their earnings. One village head, however, acknowledged that brokers are also to be blamed for perpetuating irregular and unsafe migration.

According to Yayasan Donders, family members may also speculate on the returnee worker's sexual behaviours while abroad and relate that to any perceived failure of her migration. Some women may return with children and experience stigmatization as a result.

4.4.4 The short-lived nature of stigmatization

Of most relevance, however, was the view that such stigmatization would be temporary and that communities valued the return of their members above all. Even in a case where a returnee woman has a child who had been borne out of wedlock, it was reported that families and communities would not hold a grudge for long, particularly where the women

[108] None of the organizations interviewed during the field research made a connection between the lack of legislation in the destination country as a contributing factor to vulnerability, especially in the domestic work sector. Domestic workers in Malaysia do not enjoy full protection under Malaysian labour laws and are often denied fundamental employment rights, such as the right to a paid day off a week. The lack of legislative protection, coupled with local culture which forces women to be silent about ill treatment and abuses, creates a fertile ground for exploitation while abroad.

had returned with significant wealth. Some returnee migrants commented that whatever the "issue", it only took a matter of a week before communities accepted the new reality of the situation. This was also confirmed by a representative of the West Sumba District Office who said, *"The talk about the negative experience of migrant workers only lasts for a week. The physical presence of the returned migrant, no matter of her condition, is very important for the family. In one case, a returned dead body of a migrant worker was received in celebration by the family."*

Further enquiry is needed to understand to what extent stigma is indeed short-lived and whether it may be earned in any way through the behaviour and actions of the returnee migrant following her re-entry into the community.

RECOMMENDATIONS

16. District Offices of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection to set up "support groups" for returnees (separated for males and females). Such support groups can also be offered access to local assistance and services, such as shelters, and income generation activities.

17. Central government and collaborating agencies could further enquire into how migrants experience stigma over time and what specific events and attitudes lead to its dissipation.

* Further recommendations outlined under Section 4.2 are also relevant as a response to this finding.

5. CONCLUSION

In Indonesia and the South-East Asian region, labour migration is a common and effective pathway to alleviate poverty and improve basic standards of living in families and communities. Nine million Indonesians live and work overseas[109] and many more millions live away from home within the country, remitting income to support their families. The demand and supply of cheap labour from poorer to more developed and industrialized regions provide the basic economic dynamic for the migrant labour market. Within such a context, risks and vulnerabilities in the labour migration process mainly emanate from the fundamental power imbalance between job seekers from relatively impoverished backgrounds who move away from their community and social support networks, and employers based in their home country at destination who have higher economic standing with access to relatively better assets and services. This fundamental power imbalance leaves migrants at risk of abuse, violence and exploitation at the hands of unscrupulous agents and employers motivated by either profiteering or ignorance (such as in the form of bigotry). These conditions and situational vulnerabilities lead to the high risks of unsafe migration, such as migrating through irregular means and smuggling routes, or finding work with unethical employers. Within this context, migrants are highly vulnerable to trafficking and exploitation, with secondary consequences for their families and communities.

Accordingly, the role of social norms and stigma influence migration choices, experiences as well as their very vulnerabilities and risks to trafficking, exploitation and violence. This research has provided a snapshot of a number of these influences using Sumba as a case study.

5.1 LABOUR MIGRATION IS A COMMON STRATEGY FOR POVERTY ALLEVIATION

Despite the high level of risk and cases of trafficking and exploitation, labour migration remains one of the most accessible and common strategies for supporting socioeconomic growth in families and communities. Even where migrants are aware of the dangers they may face, foreign employment trends, including through irregular and unsafe means, have only continued to persist. The research found that this reality was reflected in the Sumba region through the unchallenged narrative that labour migration was "positive" and "aspirational". The narrative was strengthened through the ongoing cycle of returnees sharing positive experiences while downplaying their negative experiences. At the same time, the community was acutely aware of family members who had left and not yet returned. Their celebration of migrants returning, no matter in what state, reveals an awareness of the risks and potential consequences. Nevertheless, the potential benefits of labour migration appear to outweigh the costs and are perhaps considered worth the risk.

5.2 PREVENTION OF TRAFFICKING REQUIRES ATTENTION TO SOCIAL AND CULTURAL ENABLERS

Prevention and protection efforts with regard to trafficking significantly focus on economic, legal and practical aspects of the causes, conditions and responses. Such a focus provides clear and tangible goals and outcomes for anti-trafficking efforts, including improved laws, regulations, recovery and reintegration services. The understanding of the social and cultural dimensions of trafficking are also key to informing responses to trafficking, particularly when they provide insights into why people behave and make the choices they do.

Attention to social norms and stigma in relation to trafficking has commonly focused on how victims of trafficking, and other returnee migrants, are received on their return to their homes and communities. Victims of trafficking often feel and are perceived as changed persons on returning home. Many will not only be traumatized from their experiences of abuse, exploitation and violence, but they will also return home to face the reaction of their family and community for their decision to migrate in the first place.

Leaving home for labour migration means stepping away from one's community and the social and cultural norms that one is expected to remain within. The decision to seek work away from home may be one made by the migrant herself, or collectively by the family. In any case, there will be expectations, both personal and familial, for what the migration will lead to. This is why, when a migrant is trafficked and exploited, one of the most difficult consequences for her is the loss

[109] World Bank. (2016). Indonesia's Rising Divide. Washington: World Bank. Accessed 2 September 2020. Available at http://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/267671467991932516/pdf/106070-WP-PUBLIC-Indonesias-Rising-Divide-English.pdf.

of hope, disappointed expectations and the potential blame and community-based stigma for having made the "wrong" decision to have left home. Such personal, psychological and social dynamics may magnify any trauma from the actual exploitation and abuse experienced as part of the trafficking experience.

In Sumba, the research explored how traditional cultural norms interacted with socioeconomic labour migration trends, with gender as the central crucible. At the community level, traditional norms ("adat") set out a gendered division of roles for men and women, in the home and in public. The patriarchal culture places women in the home, in the role of the caregiver with her social value derived from fulfilling her responsibilities through marriage, reproduction and family. Men are conditioned to take up their roles as leaders, both in the home and in public, through their hosting of traditional rituals ("pesta adat"). Central to this relationship is the transfer of bride price ("belis") through marriage, which in effect, provides a cultural reason for the man's right over the woman and her assets. Women's obligations thus relate to supporting her husband in fulfilling his role.

With low levels of education and employment, socioeconomic conditions are less than adequate in Sumba. Added to this is the burden of traditional ceremonies and other expenditures; as a result of which, families are finding themselves in debt and unable to keep up with community expectations. In this context, the external demand for foreign employment provides an opportunity for women and their families to improve their economic status and find their way out of debt. On the one hand, such a strategy may be seen as sound and justifiable. However, on the other hand, the very social norms that disempower women in decision-making, together with the inadequate governance and regulatory mechanisms to provide social safeguards, leaves the situation to be highly risky.

The research found that the systematic and cultural disempowerment of women conditions them to be submissive to representations of authority, normalizing violence and abuse in the migration cycle. Socially perceived male figures of authority dominate a woman migrant's decision-making process, from having to acquire permission from her husband and village head, to being lead and advised by the recruitment agent, who in turn is also a regarded figure in the community. In order to migrate, women need to navigate deeply entrenched patriarchal structures, both formal and informal, requiring her to access and utilize her personal knowledge, intelligence and resources. However, the disempowering conditioning that women have experienced from childhood disconnects women from their own decision-making functions; women are further encouraged to pursue coping strategies that favour passivity and forbearance. Therefore, when agents tell them "not to complain on the job", this directive is unquestioned and accepted. The research findings from this report revealed the striking impact of such gendered social norms on enabling trafficking.

5.3 UNDERSTANDING THE INFLUENCE AND CAPACITY OF GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES IS A KEY IN RESPONDING TO TRAFFICKING

This research also identified the influence of governance structures on responses to trafficking, as mandated by local and national frameworks. Various government agencies were limited in their capacity and coordination efforts with respect to collecting data and coordinating responses in regulating migration. The research findings also indicate that existing governance gaps may be incentivizing irregular migration practices which circumvent regulatory safeguards put in place to protect migrant workers. One key barrier identified was the lack of formal and genuine identity documents that migrants are able to secure through formal administrative channels. These bureaucratic challenges lead migrants to seek falsified identity documents, which in turn, may negatively impact the migrants' access to social protection, as well as their safe return to, and reintegration into their community. Furthermore, weaknesses in existing governance structures encourages migrants' higher reliance on informal structures of community and family in dealing with any challenging migration and events and experiences. As a result, migrants often must heavily depend on their families and communities, rather than government services, for their social protection needs.

5.4 ENGAGING RETURNEE MIGRANTS MUST BE AN INTEGRAL PART OF RESPONDING TO TRAFFICKING AND EXPLOITATION

It was also found that women migrants in Sumba face stigmatization on returning home, particularly where they have not fulfilled the expectations of their family and community. Inevitably, in situations where women have been trafficked and repatriated, they may face similar stigma for their experiences, such as blame, judgement as well as ostracization. However, one curious finding was that the community was also reported to have the capacity to move through its stigmatization, eventually appreciating the migrant's return over other considerations. More enquiry is needed into the

events and attitudes that lead communities to let go of their stigma, and the type of cultural resources that this outcome can be attributed to.

This research sought to understand both how social norms and stigma enable and contribute to trafficking, as well as how they may prevent appropriate and effective reintegration after the trafficking experience. One of the key themes arising from the research is that the social norms existing and enabling the unsafe migration at the beginning of the migration journey are different but related to the experience the returnee faces on coming home. To which extent the findings here are contextual or common across regions and countries remains to be seen. However, the research clearly indicates that responses to trafficking need to be informed by better and more objective understandings and insights on cultural and social norms. This needs to include not only awareness raising and training responses for duty bearers, but also initiatives at the community level to enable communities to use their own cultural and social resources to better empower and strengthen themselves and their members.

ANNEXES

ANNEX I – GLOSSARY OF KEY TERMS

Borders (international): Politically defined boundaries separating territory or maritime zones between political entities and the areas where political entities exercise border governance measures on their territory or extraterritorially. Such areas include border crossing points (airports, land border crossing points, ports), immigration and transit zones, the "no-man's land" between crossing points of neighbouring countries, as well as embassies and consulates.

Broker: Middleman or intermediary who facilitates transit and/or employment for migrant workers. The deception that brokers often use during the recruitment process leaves migrant workers vulnerable to forced labour.

Child: Every human being below the age of 18 years unless under the law applicable to the child, majority is attained earlier.

Country of destination: In the migration context, a country that is the destination for a person or a group of persons, irrespective of whether they migrate regularly or irregularly.

Country of origin: A country of nationality or of former habitual residence of a person or group of persons who have migrated abroad, irrespective of whether they migrate regularly or irregularly.

Duty bearers: People who hold positions of authority, leadership and influence, particularly in relation to the protection of people against trafficking and exploitation.

Employment agency: Any private agency other than a government body, which makes a worker available to an overseas employer by concluding a contract of employment with a worker. An employment agency is responsible for screening and matching candidates with job openings, orienting them about their future jobs, processing contracts, obtaining necessary clearances, arranging for travel, visa and other related tasks.

Exploitation: Making use of a situation to gain unfair advantage for oneself.

Forced labour: Includes *"all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered himself voluntarily"*.[110] Forced labour manifests itself through a wide range of penalties and coercive actions, including human trafficking, slavery, debt bondage, abuse of vulnerability through threats and violence, and restrictions of the freedom of movement. According to the ILO (2012), the three principal dimensions of forced labour are (i) the unfree recruitment, (ii) the duress of work and life, (iii) the impossibility to leave the employer.

Identity document: An official piece of documentation issued by the competent authority of a State designed to prove the identity of the person carrying it. The most common identity documents are national identity cards and passports.

Integration: The two-way process of mutual adaptation between migrants and the societies in which they live, whereby migrants are incorporated into the social, economic, cultural and political life of the receiving community. It entails a set of joint responsibilities for migrants and communities and incorporates other related notions such as social inclusion and social cohesion.

International migration: The movement of persons away from their place of usual residence and across an international border to a country of which they are not nationals.

Irregular migrant: Movement of persons that takes place outside the laws, regulations, or international agreements governing the entry into or exit from the State of origin, transit or destination.

[110] ILO Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29).

Labour migration: Movement of persons from one State to another, or within their own country of residence, for the purpose of employment.

Labour-sending country / source country: These terms relate to the country from which large groups of workers are recruited. In this regard, the key labour supply country is Indonesia.

Migrant: An umbrella term, not defined under international law, reflecting the common lay understanding of a person who moves away from his or her place of usual residence, whether within a country or across an international border, temporarily or permanently, and for a variety of reasons. The term includes a number of well-defined legal categories of people, such as migrant workers; persons whose particular types of movements are legally defined, such as smuggled migrants.[111]

Migrants in vulnerable situations: Migrants who are unable to effectively enjoy their human rights, are at increased risk of violations and abuse and who, accordingly, are entitled to call on a duty bearer's heightened duty of care.[112]

Migrant worker: *"A person who is engaged or has been engaged in a remunerated activity in a State of which he or she is not a national".*[113]

Migration: The movement of persons away from their place of usual residence, either across an international border or within a State.

Migration cycle: Stages of the migration process encompassing departure, in some cases transit through a State, immigration in the State of destination, and return to their country of origin.

Psychosocial support: *"Refers to the close relationship between the individual and the collective aspects of any social entity. Psychosocial support can be adapted in particular situations to respond to the psychological and physical needs of the people concerned, by helping them to accept the situation and cope with it".*[114]

Returnee: A person who has emigrated and returned to his or her country of origin.

Regular migration: Migration that occurs in compliance with the laws of the country of origin, transit and destination.

Reintegration: A process which enables individuals to re-establish the economic, social and psychosocial relationships needed to maintain life, livelihood and dignity and inclusion in civic life.

Remittances (migrant): Private international monetary transfers that migrants make, individually or collectively.

Social norms: Behavioural rules (usually informal and unwritten) on what is considered acceptable and appropriate behaviour within a group or given society.

Stigma: Disapproval of, or discrimination towards, a person based on perceivable social characteristics that are considered to be disgraceful or defective.

Trafficking: Trafficking in persons means *"the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation".*[115]

[111] At the international level, no universally accepted definition for "migrant" exists. The present definition was developed by IOM for its own purposes and it is not meant to imply or create any new legal category.
[112] Adapted from High Commissioner for Human Rights, Principles and Practical Guidance on the Protection of the Human Rights of Migrants in Vulnerable Situations.
[113] Article 2 (1) of the UN Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (1990).
[114] International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies.
[115] Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Air and Sea, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, commonly known as the Palermo Convention.

Unaccompanied children: Children, as defined in Art. 1 of the Convention on the Right of the Child, who have been separated from both parents and other relatives and are not being cared for by an adult who, by law or custom, is responsible for doing so.[116] In the context of migration, children separated from both parents and other caregivers are generally referred to as unaccompanied migrant children (UMC).

Vulnerability: Within a migration context, vulnerability is the limited capacity to avoid, resist, cope with, or recover from harm. This limited capacity is the result of the unique interaction of individual, household, community, and structural characteristics and conditions.

Young people or youth: These terms characterize the period of transition from childhood to adulthood and generally include people from 15 to 24 years of age.[117]

[116] Adapted from United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child, General Comment No. 6: Treatment of Unaccompanied and Separated Children Outside their Country of Origin (2005) CRC/GC/2005/6, 6.

[117] With the recognition that the meaning of the term "youth" varies according to economic, social and cultural contexts in difference societies around the world.

ANNEX II – LITERATURE REVIEW BIBLIOGRAPHY

Aberdein, C. and Zimmerman, C., 2015. Access to mental health and psychosocial services in Cambodia by survivors of trafficking and exploitation: a qualitative study. International journal of mental health systems, 9(1), pp. 1–13.

Asian Development Bank. (2020). Indonesia and ADB. Asian Development Bank. Available at www.adb.org/countries/indonesia/overview.

Badan Nasional Penempatan Dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia, 2019. Data of placement in 2017 and 2018. Badan Nasional Penempatan Dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia. Available at http://portal.bnp2tki.go.id/stat_penempatan/indeks.

Badan Nasional Penempatan Dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia, 2018. Data Penempatan dan Pelindungan Periode Tahun 2018 [online]. Jakarta: Pusat Penelitian Pengembangan dan Informasi (PUSLITFO). Available at http://portal.bnp2tki.go.id/uploads/data/data_12-03-2019_094615_Laporan_Pengolahan_Data_BNP2TKI_2018.pdf.

Badan Pelindungan Pekerja Migran Indonesia, 2020. Data Penempatan dan Pelindungan PMI Periode Juli 2020 [online]. Jakarta: Pusat Data dan Informasi BP2MI. Available at https://bp2mi.go.id/uploads/statistik/images/data_28-08-2020_Laporan_Pengolahan_Data_BNP2TKI_JULI_2020.pdf.

Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R., 2007. Leaving the past behind: When victims of trafficking decline assistance. Oslo: Fafo, pp. 123–133.

Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R., 2013. Coming home: Challenges in family reintegration for trafficked women. Qualitative Social Work, 12(4), pp. 454–472.

Cislaghi B., Manji K, Heise L., 2018. Social Norms and Gender-related Harmful Practices, Learning Report 2: Theory in support of better practice. Learning Group on Social Norms and Gender-related Harmful Practices, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, pp. 1–23.

Frank, C., Zamorski, M.A. and Colman, I., 2018. Stigma doesn't discriminate: physical and mental health and stigma in Canadian military personnel and Canadian civilians. BMC psychology, 6(1), pp. 1–11.

Graviano, N., Götzelmann, A., Nozarian, N. and Jawadurovna Wadud, A., 2017. Towards an integrated approach to reintegration in the context of return. Switzerland: International Organization for Migration. Available at www.iom.int/sites/default/files/our_work/DMM/AVRR/Towards-an-Integrated-Approach-to-Reintegration.pdf.

Gray, A.J., 2002. Stigma in psychiatry. Journal of the royal society of medicine, 95(2), pp. 72–76.

International Catholic Migration Commission. Trafficking of Women and Children in Indonesia. Available at https://childhub.org/en/system/tdf/library/attachments/iomc_solidarity_centre_tra.pdf?file=1&type=node&id=16313.

International Labour Organization, 2011. Decent Work Profile Indonesia. Geneva: International Labour Organization. Available at www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---integration/documents/publication/wcms_167418.pdf.

International Organization for Migration, 2007. The IOM handbook on direct assistance for victims of trafficking. International Organization for Migration.

International Organization for Migration, 2010. Gender, Migration and Remittances. Available at www.iom.int/sites/default/files/about-iom/Gender-migration-remittances-infosheet.pdf.

International Organization for Migration, 2019. Reintegration Handbook: Practical guidance on the design, implementation and monitoring of reintegration assistance. Available at https://publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/iom_reintegration_handbook.pdf.

Kompas.com, 2020. Kahwin tangkap di Sumba, Diculik untuk Dinikahi, Citra Menagis sampai Tenggorokan Kering. Kompas.com. 7 September 2020. Available at https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/07/09/06070001/kawin-tangkap-di-sumba-diculik-untuk-dinikahi-citra-menangis-sampai?page=all#page2.

Le, P.D., 2017. "Reconstructing a Sense of Self" Trauma and Coping Among Returned Women Survivors of Human Trafficking in Vietnam. Qualitative health research, 27(4), pp. 509–519.

Listiani, T., 2017. An analysis of gendered labor migration in rural Indonesia: A case study of the Indramayu Regency, West Java, Indonesia. **政策科学** *[Social Policy],* 25(1), pp. 153–169.

Nurdiah, E.A., Altrerosje, A.S.R.I. and Hariyanto, A.D., 2015. Gendered Space in West Sumba Traditional Houses. DIMENSI (Journal of Architecture and Built Environment), 42(2), pp. 69–76.

Nyblade, L., Stockton, M.A., Giger, K., Bond, V., Ekstrand, M.L., Mc Lean, R., Mitchell, E.M., La Ron, E.N., Sapag, J.C., Siraprapasiri, T. and Turan, J., 2019. Stigma in health facilities: why it matters and how we can change it. BMC medicine, 17(1), pp. 1–15.

Puhl, R.M. and Heuer, C.A., 2010. Obesity stigma: important considerations for public health. American journal of public health, 100(6), pp. 1019–1028.

Republic of Indonesia. Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 21 Year 2007 on The Eradication of the Criminal Act of Trafficking in Persons. Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Department of Justice and Human Rights Republic of Indonesia. Available at www.warnathgroup.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/Indonesia-TIP-Law-2007.pdf.

Scambler, G., 1998. Stigma and disease: changing paradigms. The Lancet, 352(9133), pp. 1054–1055.

Stuart, H., 2004. Stigma and work. Healthcare papers, 5(2), pp. 100–111.

Surtees, R., 2017. Moving On: Family and Community Reintegration Among Indonesian Trafficking Victims. NEXUS Institute. Available at https://nexushumantrafficking.files.wordpress.com/2015/02/moving-on-nexus-october-2017-compressed.pdf

World Bank, 2016. Indonesia's Rising Divide [online]. Washington. Available at http://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/267671467991932516/pdf/106070-WP-PUBLIC-Indonesias-Rising-Divide-English.pdf.

World Bank, 2017. "Indonesia's Global Workers: Juggling Opportunities & Risks. pp. 1–82.

U.S. Department of State, 2018. 2018 Trafficking in Persons Report: Indonesia. Available at www.state.gov/reports/2018-trafficking-in-persons-report/indonesia/.

UNICEF, 2015. Maternal and Newborn Health Disparities in Indonesia. Available at https://data.unicef.org/resources/maternal-newborn-health-disparities-country-profiles/.

United Nations Office on Drugs, Crime, Division for Treaty Affairs Staff, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. Division for Treaty Affairs, 2004. Legislative Guides for the Implementation of the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto. United Nations Publications.

Vel, J.A., 2008. Uma politics; An ethnography of democratization in West Sumba, Indonesia, 1986-2006 (pp. XVII–277). Brill.

ANNEX III – LIST OF STAKEHOLDERS

Agency	Type of Organization and Location
Yayasan Pengembangan Kemanusiaan Donders	Faith-based organization, South-west Sumba
The Office of Manpower	District government agency, South-west Sumba
The Office of Social Affairs	District government agency, South-west Sumba
The Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection	District government agency, South-west Sumba
Timor Ekspres	Media agency, South-west Sumba
Jaringan Relawan untuk Kemanusiaan (JRuK)	Faith-based organization, South-west Sumba
Sarnelli	Faith-based organization, West Sumba
The Office of Manpower	District government agency, West Sumba
The Office of Social Affairs	District government agency, West Sumba
The Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection	District government agency, West Sumba
Local activist/ community organizer	West Sumba
Serikat Buruh Migran Indonesia (SBMI)	Non-governmental organization, Jakarta
Ministry of Manpower	Central government agency, Jakarta
Agency for the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers (BP2MI). Formally known as National Agency for the Placement and Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers (BNP2TKI)	Central government agency, Jakarta
Ministry of Social Affairs	Central government agency, Jakarta
Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection	Central government agency, Jakarta
Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture	Central government agency, Jakarta
Agency for the Protection of Witnesses and Victims (LPSK)	Central government agency, Jakarta
Village Head	West Sumba

Village Head	South-west Sumba
Migrant Care	Non-governmental organization, Jakarta
PT Isti Jaya Mandiri	Recruitment agency, Jakarta

ANNEX IV – CONSENT FORM

This research is part of the International Organization of Migration (IOM) Assessing Stigma for Prevention, Improved Response and Evidence base (ASPIRE) project, which aims to increase protection of migrants and improve support for returnees. The research will help inform programme and training activities in Indonesia.

I ..... agree to participate in the research being conducted on behalf of IOM.

1. My participation in this research is voluntary. I understand that I will not be paid for my participation. I may withdraw or stop my participation at any time during the interview without penalty.
2. I understand that the discussion and the information will be valuable for the research. However, if I feel uncomfortable in any way during the interview session, I have the right to decline to answer any question or to end the interview.
3. Participation involves being interviewed by an IOM designated researcher. Notes will be written during the interview.
4. I understand that my name or anything that will make me identifiable will not be included in any reports or publications from this research.
5. Any personal identifying information I share will be stored safely and securely and not shared beyond the research team.
6. If during the interview the researcher is made aware of any person currently experiencing serious abuse or is at high risk of serious and imminent harm, I understand that the researcher may need to report this to authorities and therefore in this instance there will be limits to confidentiality.
7. The purpose of this research has been explained to me and I have been given the opportunity to have my questions answered.
8. An audio tape and/or photos of the interview will be made only with my explicit permission. If I don't want to be taped or photographed the interview will not be recorded digitally.

Please circle:

I AGREE / DISAGREE to being audio taped during the interview.

I AGREE / DISAGREE to photographs being taken during the interview.

I am participating in this research freely and understand the terms of this consent. I give permission to IOM and the researchers acting on behalf of IOM to collect, use, disclose and dispose of the information I have provided.

....

Signed **Date**

....

Interpreter's signature **Parent / guardian signature**

Commissioned by IOM UK

IOM UN MIGRATION

embode

UKaid from the British people